

## **Testimony for the Senate Judicial Proceedings Committee**

## March 1, 2023

## SB 747 - Public Information Act - Personnel Records - Police Officers

## UNFAVORABLE

The Maryland Coalition for Justice and Police Accountability respectfully urges an unfavorable report on SB 747, which seeks to undo much of the progress towards police accountability and transparency that community members, advocates, and legislators made during the 2021 session. During the 2021 session, the General Assembly successfully passed "Anton's Law." Anton's Law was a key part of the Speaker's package of police reform measures in 2021, which was extensively debated and discussed over multiple hearings and work sessions. The package was the product of years of effort and was hailed by legislators as "historic."<sup>1</sup> Under Anton's Law, internal investigations and disciplinary records would no longer be considered personnel records and would, therefore, no longer be subject to mandatory nondisclosure under the MPIA. The passage of Anton's Law shed light on these previously secret processes, facilitating greater community oversight of the law enforcement agencies that serve them.

This bill, however, would reclassify most of these records, making them personnel records once again. Aside from records relating to allegations of racial bias or excessive force, all other records would once again be shielded from public access. These extremely narrow exceptions fail to provide adequate transparency, blocking access to every other type of misconduct. Of the many types of serious incidents or investigations that would *not* be available to the public, and would again be required to be kept secret, are improper arrests, improper searches of people (including improper strip searches or cavity searches), improper stop and frisks, improper seizures of property or vehicles (including where officers plant evidence), improper seizures of property or destroying property (like deleting videos of police from a cell phone), interfering with the First Amendment right to record police activity, refusing to obtain medical treatment, sexual harassment and misconduct, improper high-speed pursuits, improperly inquiring into immigration status,

<sup>1</sup> Gaskill, H., & amp; Kurtz, J. (2021, April 8). General Assembly Passes Police Reform Package On to the Governor. Maryland Matters. Retrieved February 28, 2023, from https://www.marylandmatters.org/2021/04/08/general-assembly-passes-police-reform-package-on-to-the-governor/



leaking information to criminals, per jury, extortion, etc.  $^{2}\,$  The list could go on and on.

It is clearly in the public's interest to have access to these types of records. We know that internal mechanisms to hold officers accountable for all types of misconduct are inadequate.<sup>3</sup> According to the Graham report released in 2021, the Prince George's County Police Department routinely failed to adequately respond to internal and external complaints of racial harassment, discrimination, and misuse of force. Additionally, a 2016 Department of Justice (DOJ) investigation into the Baltimore Police Department (BPD) revealed that handling of complaints, oversight, and internal investigations were inadequate and ineffective and contributed to a culture of racism, misuse of force, unlawful enforcement, and an overall lack of oversight and accountability. Adequate discipline was persistently rare and applied inconsistently. BPD repeatedly failed to take action against those known to engage in repeated misconduct.

Additionally, as noted in the 2016 DOJ investigation, complaints of misconduct are often downgraded to lower-level offenses. In one instance, one man's complaint of racial discrimination and the use of a racial slur by an officer was inexplicably downgraded to "inappropriate comments, profanity, or gestures to a departmental member." The Department of Justice recognized numerous purposeful attempts to disguise and excuse racialized enforcement by improperly classifying complaints.<sup>4</sup> This bill would not only block public access to the complaints that were improperly downgraded, it would incentive the misclassification of these complaints.

https://www.leg.state.nv.us/Session/77th2013/Exhibits/Assembly/JUD/AJUD338L.pdf

<sup>3</sup> Bromwich, M. R., Weinstein, J. M., Peck, R. B., Dubyak, K. M., Fletcher, W. G., Purce, J. M., &amp; Shephard, T. D. (2022, January). Anatomy of the Gun Trace Task Force Scandal: It's Origins, Causes, and Consequences. Steptoe &amp; Johnson LLP. Retrieved February 28, 2023, from <a href="https://www.steptoe.com/en/news-publications/steptoe-releases-investigative-report-on-the-gun-trace-task-force-scandal.html">https://www.steptoe.com/en/news-publications/steptoe-releases-investigative-report-on-the-gun-trace-task-force-scandal.html</a>; Washington Lawyer's Committee for Civil Rights and Urban Affairs. (2020, August 28). EXPERT REPORT OF MICHAEL E. GRAHAM In Hispanic National Law Enforcement Association NCR et al. v. Prince George's County et al., District of Maryland No. 18-cv-3821. WashLaw. Retrieved February 28, 2023, from <a href="https://www.washlaw.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/HNLEA-v-PGC-Aug-28-Graham-Report-Unsealed.pdf">https://www.washlaw.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/HNLEA-v-PGC-Aug-28-Graham-Report-Unsealed.pdf</a>; U.S. Department of Justice Civil Rights Division. (2016, August 10). INVESTIGATION OF THE BALTIMORE CITY POLICE DEPARTMENT. U.S. Department of Justice. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.justice.gov/crt/file/883296/download">https://www.justice.gov/crt/file/883296/download</a>

 $<sup>^2</sup>$  According to a 2010 CATO institute report, sexual misconduct is the second most common form of police misconduct.

Cato Institute. (2010). THE CATO INSTITUTE'S NATIONAL POLICE MISCONDUCT REPORTING PROJEC. www.leg.state.nv.us. Retrieved from



The PIA is meant to provide a means by which citizens can hold government agencies accountable. Barring these records from public view is contrary to public interest, the intent of the PIA, and the intent of the legislature in 2021. The records in question under this bill provide critical insight into how police agencies respond to allegations of misconduct. Barring these records from public view represents a purposeful attempt to roll back strides towards community oversight and an utter disregard for community sentiment.

For the foregoing reasons, the Maryland Coalition for Justice and Police Accountability urges an unfavorable report on SB 747.

Respectfully, Maryland Coalition for Justice & Police Accountability (members listed below)

ACLU of Maryland ACLU of Maryland, Montgomery County Chapter **Amnesty International** Arts Education in Maryland Schools (AEMS) Alliance **Baltimore Action Legal Team** Baltimore Bern Unit Baltimore City Civilian Review Board Baltimore for Border Justice Be More Unified Council on American-Islamic Relations (CAIR) - Maryland CASA Caucus of African-Americans Leaders **Citizens Policing Project** Coalition for Justice for Anton Black Coalition of Concerned Mothers Coalition of People Opposed Violence and Extremism **Common Cause Maryland** Community Actively Seeking Transparency (C.A.S.T.) **Community Justice** Democratic Socialists of America – Baltimore City Democratic Socialists of America - Greater Baltimore Democratic Socialists of America – Prince George's County **Disability Rights Maryland** 



Do the Most Good **Drug Policy Alliance Equality Matters** For Kathy's Sake **FreeState Justice Greenbelt** People Power Hispanic National Law Enforcement Association Homeless Persons Representation Project **Innocence** Project InterFaith Action for Human Rights Jews United For Justice **Justice Policy Institute** The JustUs Initiative Kevin L. Cooper Foundation Law Enforcement Action Partnership Leaders of a Beautiful Struggle League of Women Voters Maryland LGBTQ Dignity Project Life After Release Making Changes LLC Mama Sisterhood of Prince George's County March for Our Lives Maryland Maryland Alliance for Justice Reform Maryland Center on Economic Policy Maryland Consumer Rights Coalition Maryland Defenders Union Maryland Justice Project Maryland Poor People's Campaign Maryland Prisoners' Rights Coalition Maryland Restorative Justice Initiative Montgomery County Civil Rights Coalition Montgomery County Democratic Socialists of America Mothers on the Move NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund National Coalition for Drug Legalization Nigerian American Lawyers Association - Washington DC Chapter **Organizing Black** Our Maryland **Our Prince George's** 



Our Revolution Maryland Power Inside Prevent Gun Violence Ministry, River **Road Unitarian Universalist Congregation** Policy Foundation of Maryland Prince George's People's Coalition **Prisons to Professionals Progressive Maryland** Public Justice Center **Racial Justice NOW!** Rebuild, Overcome, and Rise (ROAR) Center at University of Maryland-Baltimore **Reproductive Justice Inside** Sanctuary DMV **SEIU 1199** Showing up for Racial Justice, Annapolis and Anne Arundel County Showing Up for Racial Justice, Baltimore Showing Up for Racial Justice, Montgomery County Sierra Club Maryland Chapter Silver Spring Justice Coalition Takoma Park Mobilization The Women of Color For Equal Justice Law Center West Wednesdays Wicomico County NAACP Branch 7028 Young People for Progress