Unofficial Copy E2 1999 Regular Session 9lr1105

\_\_\_\_\_

By: Delegates Marriott, Billings, Fulton, Benson, Montague, Oaks, Cryor, V.
Jones, C. Davis, Brown, Kirk, Dobson, Healey, Nathan-Pulliam, Carlson,
Menes, Pendergrass, Mandel, Goldwater, Grosfeld, Bronrott, Branch,
Bobo, Hurson, Swain, and Shriver

Introduced and read first time: February 11, 1999

Assigned to: Judiciary

## A BILL ENTITLED

2	Study of the Administration of the Death Penalty	,
$\angle$	Study of the Administration of the Death Fenalty	

- 3 FOR the purpose of requiring the Department of Criminology at the University of
- 4 Maryland, College Park to conduct a study of the administration of the death
- 5 penalty in the State for the purpose of determining the extent of racial
- 6 discrimination in the death penalty process; requiring that the study include an
- 7 extensive empirical examination of charging and sentencing outcomes, including
- 8 the gathering of certain case history information and the use of statistical
- 9 analyses that will allow researchers to address certain specified issues relating
- to racial discrimination; prohibiting the State from spending more than a
- certain amount to fund the study; requiring that the study be completed on or
- before a certain date; requiring that the results of the study be reported to the
- General Assembly by a certain date; and generally relating to the
- administration of the death penalty.

15 Preamble

- WHEREAS, Maryland has the highest percentage of racial minorities on death row in the United States; and
- WHEREAS, In 1993, the Governor's Commission on the Death Penalty found
- 19 that "there is no evidence of intentional discrimination in the implementation of the
- 20 death penalty in Maryland, but racial disparities in its implementation remain a
- 21 matter of legitimate concern"; and
- WHEREAS, In 1996, the Governor established a Task Force on the Fair
- 23 Imposition of Capital Punishment in Maryland and stated that "further inquiry that
- 24 focuses on the apparent disproportionate representation in capital cases according to
- 25 the race of the defendant and the race of the victim is in the interest of justice"; and
- WHEREAS, The Task Force on the Fair Imposition of Capital Punishment in
- 27 Maryland concluded that it had insufficient resources to discover the causes of racial
- 28 disparity in Maryland's death penalty system and recommended that a study be

- 1 conducted "with a specific focus on obtaining quantitative, qualitative, and anecdotal
- 2 data about the potential causes of racial disparity in the imposition of capital
- 3 punishment in Maryland"; and
- 4 WHEREAS, The judges of the Court of Appeals agreed that a study of racial
- 5 disparity in the administration of the death penalty in Maryland "may be both
- 6 appropriate and worthwhile" but concluded that such a study should not be
- 7 undertaken by the Court of Appeals; and
- 8 WHEREAS, The Maryland Commission on Criminal Sentencing Policy, whose
- 9 mission included "an examination of sentencing disparity (i.e., the influence of legal
- 10 and extralegal factors in the sentence outcome)" in Maryland, noted in its Final
- 11 Report (December 30, 1998) that "Maryland's existing guidelines were developed to
- 12 eliminate inappropriate sentence disparities" but that "extralegal factors (in
- 13 particular race/ethnicity) were found to influence the incarceration decision"; and
- WHEREAS, The Maryland Commission on Criminal Sentencing Policy also
- 15 stated in its Final Report that the results of its research on sentencing disparity in
- 16 Maryland suggest that "while legal factors such as a defendant's criminal history and
- 17 the seriousness of the offense have a most powerful influence on sentence outcome,
- 18 extralegal factors appear to play a lesser role in determining sentencing outcome" and
- 19 that "the sentence outcome is not simply a function of legal factors and that the
- 20 adoption of sentencing guidelines has not entirely eliminated the consideration of
- 21 extralegal factors"; and
- 22 WHEREAS, The Maryland Commission on Criminal Sentencing Policy
- 23 concluded in its Final Report that "[a] major goal of the existing voluntary/advisory
- 24 sentencing guidelines is to reduce unwarranted sentencing disparity" but that the
- 25 Commission's research "raised questions about the effectiveness of the existing
- 26 guidelines in reducing unwarranted sentencing disparity"; now, therefore,
- 27 SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF
- 28 MARYLAND, That:
- 29 (a) The Department of Criminology at the University of Maryland, College
- 30 Park shall conduct a study of the administration of the death penalty in the State for
- 31 the purpose of determining the extent of race-based discrimination in the death
- 32 penalty process.
- 33 (b) The study shall include an extensive empirical examination of charging
- 34 and sentencing outcomes, including the gathering of detailed case history information
- 35 and the use of statistical analyses that will allow researchers to address the following
- 36 issues:
- 37 (1) whether the race of the defendant or victim affects a prosecutor's
- 38 decision to charge a defendant with a crime that is punishable by death or to file a
- 39 notice of intent to seek a sentence of death;
- 40 (2) whether the race of the defendant or victim affects the decision of a
- 41 judge or jury to impose a sentence of death;

## **HOUSE BILL 538**

- 1 (3) whether the jurisdiction within which a crime occurs affects a 2 prosecutor's decision to charge a defendant with a crime that is punishable by death 3 or to file a notice of intent to seek a sentence of death;
- 4 (4) whether the jurisdiction within which a crime occurs affects the 5 decision of a judge or jury to impose a sentence of death; and
- 6 (5) whether homicides with comparable characteristics are treated in 7 comparable ways by prosecutors at the charging stage and by judges and juries at the 8 sentencing stage.
- 9 (c) The State may not spend more than \$200,000 to fund the study.
- 10 (d) The study shall be completed on or before December 1, 2001.
- 11 (e) The Department of Criminology at the University of Maryland, College
- 12 Park shall report the results of the study to the General Assembly, as provided under
- 13 § 2-1246 of the State Government Article, on or before January 1, 2002.
- 14 SECTION 2. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall take effect
- 15 October 1, 1999.