J2 8lr2599 CF SB 764

By: Delegates Nathan-Pulliam, Benson, Donoghue, Harrison, Jones, Mizeur, Montgomery, Morhaim, Oaks, Pena-Melnyk, Riley, Tarrant, V. Turner, and Weldon Weldon, and Stein

Introduced and read first time: February 6, 2008 Assigned to: Health and Government Operations

Committee Report: Favorable with amendments

House action: Adopted

Read second time: March 19, 2008

CHAPTER _____

1 AN ACT concerning

2

3

4

5 6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

State Board of Dental Examiners - Nomination of Members - Investigation and Disciplinary Procedures - Data Collection

State Board of Dental Examiners Nomination and Disciplinary Processes
Task Force on the Discipline of Health Care Professionals and Improved

Patient Care

FOR the purpose of requiring certain academies, associations, organizations, or societies committed to the practice of dentistry and dental hygiene to the State Board of Dental Examiners to conduct a certain solicitation and balloting process and submit to the Governor certain lists of names of individuals for nomination for membership on the State Board of Dental Examiners Board; requiring that individuals on certain lists reflect the Board to develop guidelines for certain solicitations and ballots that to the extent possible will result in a certain Board composition reflecting certain diversity of the State; requiring that certain members appointed to the Board reflect certain diversity of the State: requiring the Governor to appoint a president of the Board from among certain Board members; requiring the executive director of the Board to report to the Secretary of Health and Mental Hygiene; altering the parties who may initiate or file certain complaints; prohibiting certain complaints from being filed more than a certain time after a certain date; requiring that certain investigations be based on certain facts; prohibiting the Board from investigating certain complaints; prohibiting certain assistant attorneys general from assisting in or conducting certain investigations; prohibiting certain assistant attorneys general from being involved in certain disciplinary

EXPLANATION: CAPITALS INDICATE MATTER ADDED TO EXISTING LAW.

[Brackets] indicate matter deleted from existing law.

<u>Underlining</u> indicates amendments to bill.

Strike out indicates matter stricken from the bill by amendment or deleted from the law by amendment.



 $\frac{1}{2}$

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

1415

16 17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

26

27

29

32

proceedings until certain votes to charge have taken place; prohibiting the Board from conducting certain records under certain circumstances; prohibiting the Board from continuing certain investigations under certain circumstances; requiring the Board to conclude certain actions on complaints within a certain time after a complaint is filed unless the Board can demonstrate certain delays; requiring the Board to adopt certain regulations in consultation with the Office of the Attorney General concerning certain disciplinary procedures before a certain date; requiring the Board to begin collecting certain information on race and ethnicity, develop a certain methodology and database for tracking and analyzing certain complaints, institute a certain status report monitoring tool for certain disciplinary cases, implement a certain case-audit study, and develop a certain nominating process by a certain date; requiring the Office of the Attorney General to provide a rotation process for certain assistant attorneys general; requiring the Board to submit a certain report by a certain date; establishing a Task Force on the Discipline of Health Care Professionals and Improved Patient Care; providing for the membership of the Task Force; providing for the designation of a chair of the Task Force; providing for staff for the Task Force; prohibiting a member of the Task Force from receiving compensation; authorizing a member of the Task Force to receive reimbursement for certain expenses; requiring the Task Force to study certain issues, issue certain recommendations, and report to the Governor and certain committees of the General Assembly on or before a certain date; and generally relating to the State Board of Dental Examiners and the Task Force on the Discipline of Health Care Professionals and Improved Patient Care.

```
25 BY repealing and reenacting, with amendments,
```

Article – Health Occupations

Section 4–202(a), 4–203, 4–204(e), and 4–316 and (b)

28 Annotated Code of Maryland

(2005 Replacement Volume and 2007 Supplement)

30 SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF MARYLAND, That the Laws of Maryland read as follows:

Article - Health Occupations

- 33 4–202.
- 34 (a) (1) The Board consists of 16 members.
- 35 (2) Of the 16 Board members:
- 36 (i) 9 shall be licensed dentists;
- 37 (ii) 4 shall be licensed dental hygienists; and
- 38 (iii) 3 shall be consumer members.

1 2 3 4 5 6	(3) (I) The SUBJECT TO SUBSECTION (B)(1) OF THIS SECTION, THE Governor shall appoint the dentist Board members, with the advice of the Secretary, from a list of names submitted to the Governor [jointly] by the [Maryland State Dental Association and the Maryland Dental Society] ESTABLISHED ACADEMIES, ASSOCIATIONS, ORGANIZATIONS, OR SOCIETIES IN THE STATE COMMITTED TO EXCELLENCE IN THE PRACTICE OF DENTISTRY BOARD.
7 8 9	(II) The number of names on the list for one vacancy shall be at least four names, for two vacancies at least three names for each vacancy, and for three or more vacancies at least two names for each vacancy.
10	(III) THE INDIVIDUALS ON THE LIST SHALL REASONABLY
11	REFLECT THE GEOGRAPHIC, RACIAL, ETHNIC, CULTURAL, AND GENDER
12	DIVERSITY OF THE STATE.
13 14 15 16 17 18	(4) (I) The SUBJECT TO SUBSECTION (B)(2) OF THIS SECTION, THE Governor shall appoint the dental hygienist Board members, with the advice of the Secretary, from a list of names submitted to the Governor by the [Maryland Dental Hygienists' Association] ESTABLISHED ACADEMIES, ASSOCIATIONS, OR SOCIETIES IN THE STATE-COMMITTED TO EXCELLENCE IN THE PRACTICE OF DENTAL HYGIENE BOARD.
19 20	(II) The number of names on the list shall be four times the number of vacancies.
21 22 23	(III) THE INDIVIDUALS ON THE LIST SHALL REASONABLY REFLECT THE GEOGRAPHIC, RACIAL, ETHNIC, CULTURAL, AND GENDER DIVERSITY OF THE STATE.
24 25	(5) The Governor shall appoint the consumer members with the advice of the Secretary and the advice and consent of the Senate.
26 27 28	(6) TO THE EXTENT PRACTICABLE, THE MEMBERS APPOINTED TO THE BOARD SHALL REASONABLY REFLECT THE GEOGRAPHIC, RACIAL, ETHNIC, CULTURAL, AND GENDER DIVERSITY OF THE STATE.
29 30 31 32	(b) [(1) At a joint meeting held by the Maryland State Dental Association and the Maryland Dental Society called to choose nominees for a dentist vacancy on the Board, a majority of the dentists present at the meeting shall choose the list of names of dentist nominees to the Board for submission to the Governor.
33	(2) At a meeting held by the Maryland Dental Hygienists' Association

called to choose nominees for a dental hygienist vacancy on the Board, a majority of the dental hygienists present at the meeting shall choose the list of names of dental hygienist nominees to the Board for submission to the Governor.

1 2 3 4 5	(3) At least 2 weeks before a meeting is held under paragraph (1) of this subsection, the secretaries of the appropriate organizations shall mail to each licensed practitioner actively practicing in Maryland, at the address appearing in their records or the records of the Board, a notice that states the time, place, and purpose of the meeting.
6 7 8 9	(4) At least 2 weeks before a meeting is held under paragraph (2) of this subsection, the Secretary of the Maryland Dental Hygienists' Association shall mail to each licensed dental hygienist, at the address appearing in their records or the records of the Board, a notice that states the time, place, and purpose of the meeting.]
10	(1) FOR EACH LICENSED DENTIST VACANCY, THE BOARD SHALL:
11 12	(I) SEND BY MAIL A WRITTEN SOLICITATION FOR NOMINATIONS TO FILL THE VACANCY TO:
13	1. EACH DENTIST LICENSED BY THE BOARD; AND
14 15	2. EACH STATE DENTAL ORGANIZATION AFFILIATED WITH A NATIONAL ORGANIZATION; AND
16 17 18	(II) CONDUCT A BALLOTING PROCESS BY WHICH EACH DENTIST LICENSED BY THE STATE IS ELIGIBLE TO VOTE TO SELECT THE NAMES OF THE LICENSED DENTISTS TO BE SUBMITTED TO THE GOVERNOR.
19 20	(2) FOR EACH LICENSED DENTAL HYGIENIST VACANCY, THE BOARD SHALL:
21 22	(I) SEND BY MAIL A WRITTEN SOLICITATION FOR NOMINATIONS TO FILL THE VACANCY TO:
23 24	1. EACH DENTAL HYGIENIST LICENSED BY THE BOARD; AND
25 26	2. EACH STATE DENTAL HYGIENIST ORGANIZATION AFFILIATED WITH A NATIONAL ORGANIZATION; AND
27 28 29 30	(II) CONDUCT A BALLOTING PROCESS BY WHICH EACH DENTAL HYGIENIST LICENSED BY THE STATE IS ELIGIBLE TO VOTE TO SELECT THE NAMES OF THE LICENSED DENTAL HYGIENISTS TO BE SUBMITTED TO THE GOVERNOR.
31 32	(3) THE BOARD SHALL DEVELOP GUIDELINES FOR THE SOLICITATION OF NOMINATIONS AND BALLOTING PROCESS THAT TO THE
33	EXTENT POSSIBLE WILL RESULT IN THE OVERALL COMPOSITION OF THE BOARD

1	REASONABLY RI	EFLECTING THE GEOGRAPHIC, RACIAL, ETHNIC, AND GENDER
$\overset{-}{2}$	DIVERSITY OF TI	
_		
3	4–203.	
4	(A) FRO	M AMONG THE BOARD MEMBERS, THE GOVERNOR SHALL
5	APPOINT A PRES	•
6	[(a)] (B)	From among its members, the Board shall elect (a president and) a
7	secretary.	- rom annong too moments, and boar a stant order (a prostacine anna) a
8	[(b)] (C)	The Board shall determine:
9	(1)	The manner of election of [officers] THE SECRETARY;
10	(2)	The term of office of each officer; and
11	(3)	The duties of each officer.
12	4–204.	
13	(c) (1)	[The] EXCEPT AS PROVIDED IN PARAGRAPH (2) OF THIS
14		HE Board may employ a staff, INCLUDING AN EXECUTIVE
15	•	cordance with the budget of the Board.
10	Difference in according to the according	cordance with the budget of the board.
16	(2)	THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE BOARD SHALL REPORT TO
17	THE SECRETARY	
18	4-316.	
19	(a) (1)	On-{its own initiative or on} a written complaint AGAINST A
20	LICENSEE filed v	vith the Board by [any person] A PATIENT OF THE LICENSEE OR A
21	PATIENT'S LEGA	L GUARDIAN, the Board may commence proceedings under § 4-315
22	of this subtitle.	
23	(2)	A COMPLAINT MAY NOT BE FILED MORE THAN 2 YEARS AFTER
24	· /	E OCCURRENCE ON WHICH THE COMPLAINT IS BASED.
25	(h) [If o	person who is not a member of the Board files a complaint, the A
26	complaint shall:	person who is not a memoer of the Board mes a complaint, the 12
27	(1)	Be in writing;
28	(2)	Be verified by a person who is familiar with the alleged facts;
29	(3)	Request Board action; and

1	(4)	Be filed with the secretary of the Board.
2 3	(e) (1) the complaint:	The Board shall investigate each complaint filed with the Board if
4 5	4 -315 of this subt	(i) Alleges facts that are grounds for action under §
6		(ii) Meets the requirements of this section.
7 8 9	_	[If the Board begins action on its own initiative or if after ects to substitute its own complaint for one filed by a person who is he Board, the Board shall prepare a written complaint.]
10 11	OF A COMPLAINT	(I) EACH INVESTIGATION SHALL BE BASED ON THE FACTS
12 13	BOARD MAY NOT	(H) IF A COMPLAINT IS NOT SUPPORTED BY FACTS, THE CONDUCT AN INVESTIGATION.
14 15	BY A THIRD PAR T	(HI) THE BOARD MAY NOT INVESTIGATE A COMPLAINT MADE
16 17	(3) or conduct an	(I) AN ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL MAY NOT ASSIST IN INVESTIGATION.
18 19 20	INVOLVED IN A	(II) AN ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL MAY NOT BECOME DISCIPLINARY PROCEEDING UNTIL AFTER THE BOARD HAS GEALICENSEE.
21 22 23 24 25	determines that a not constitute gr allegation concerr	If, after performing [any] A preliminary investigation, the Board n allegation involving fees for professional or ancillary services does to ounds for discipline or other action, the Board may refer the ning a member of a professional society or association composed of a care to a committee of the Society for Mediation.
26 27 28		IF AFTER PERFORMING A PRELIMINARY INVESTIGATION, THE INES THAT A COMPLAINT IS NOT SUPPORTED BY FACTS, THE COLLECT ADDITIONAL RECORDS.
29 30 31	DISCIPLINE A LI	BOARD MAY NOT CONTINUE TO INVESTIGATE A COMPLAINT OR CENSEE IF THE PATIENT WHO INITIATED THE COMPLAINT OR CUARDIAN WITHDRAWS THE COMPLAINT.

1 2 3 4	CONTROL, THE INCLUDING DISC	ESS THE BOARD CAN DEMONSTRATE DELAYS OUTSIDE OF ITS BOARD SHALL CONCLUDE ITS ACTION ON A COMPLAINT, IPLINE AND PROBATIONARY PERIODS, WITHIN 2 YEARS AFTER OMPLAINT WAS FILED.
5	SECTION 2	. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That:
6 7		before December 31, 2008, the State Board of Dental Examiners gulations for the rules of procedure for the disciplinary process.
8 9 10	established acader	Board shall draft the new regulations in consultation with each my, association, organization, or society committed to excellence in e of the Attorney General.
11	(c) The n	ew regulations shall include:
12	(1)	guidelines for complaints;
13 14 15	(2) warranted and th under different circ	guidelines for investigations such as when an investigation is e thoroughness and length of an investigation that is warranted cumstances;
16 17 18 19 20	corresponding deg	to assure that similar acts of misconduct receive similar penalties, and system for substantiated complaints and guidelines for grees of sanctions based on the sanctioning methodologies and tified in the pilot study prepared by the Virginia Department of s;
21 22	(4) for completion of p	guidelines for probationary periods such as length <u>and conditions</u> robationary periods;
23	(5)	an appeals process; <u>and</u>
24 25 26	(6) and address from Board ; and	guidelines for confidentiality including the removal of the name the disciplinary and complaint documents that come before the
27	(7)	a process for expunging a licensee's disciplinary records if:
28 29	years before the ex	(i) the act resulting in the disciplinary action occurred over 10 epungement; and
30 31	10 years before the	(ii) the licensee has not had another disciplinary action within expungement.
32	SECTION 3	a. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That, on or before December

31, 2008, the State Board of Dental Examiners shall:

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

28

31

- 1 **(1)** begin to collect race, gender, and ethnicity information on all 2 licensees during the application process based on the Maryland official standard 3 method for collecting race, gender, and ethnicity information; 4 develop a concise methodology of including standard definitions (2)5 and written guidelines for tracking the status of all complaints from the initial 6 allegation through to sanctions and final action and keep records of the information for 7 future audits:
- 8 (3) develop a database by re-engineering or modifying the software 9 that analyzes complaint data so that the data may be analyzed in a variety of manners 10 and subjectivity and individual bias may be reduced;
- 11 (4) institute the development, use, and routine review of a comprehensive status report as a monitoring tool for all disciplinary cases;
- 13 (5) implement a case audit that studies selected cases, de–identifying 14 files, and using outside experts; and
 - develop a nominating process for Board members that includes each established academy, association, or society committed to excellence in the practice of dentistry and dental hygiene and so that nominees reasonably reflect the geographic, racial, ethnic, cultural, and gender diversity of the State in accordance with § 4–202(a) and (b) of the Health Occupations Article, as enacted by Section 1 of this Act.
 - SECTION 4. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That the Office of the Attorney General shall provide a rotation process for assistant attorneys general working for the State Board of Dental Examiners.
- SECTION 5. 4. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That, on or before December 31, 2008, the State Board of Dental Examiners shall report to the General Assembly, in accordance with § 2–1246 of the State Government Article, on the implementation of Section 1 through Section 3 of this Act.

SECTION 5. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That:

- 29 <u>(a) There is a Task Force on the Discipline of Health Care Professionals and</u> 30 Improved Patient Care.
 - (b) The Task Force consists of the following members:
- 32 (1) one member of the House of Delegates, appointed by the Speaker of 33 the House;
- 34 (2) one member of the Senate of Maryland, appointed by the President of the Senate;

$\frac{1}{2}$	designee;	<u>(3)</u>	the Se	ecretary of Health and Mental Hygiene, or the Secretary's
3		<u>(4)</u>	the At	torney General, or the Attorney General's designee;
4 5	designee;	<u>(5)</u>	the C	thief Administrative Law Judge, or the Chief Judge's
6 7	Secretary o	(<u>6)</u> f Healt		rrent health occupation board members, appointed by the lental Hygiene;
8 9 10 11	_		that m	urrent executive directors or administrators for health hay not be from the same boards as the representatives in a appointed by the Secretary of Health and Mental Hygiene;
12 13	professiona	(8) l discip		ndividuals appointed by the Governor having expertise in matters including at least:
14			<u>(i)</u>	two representatives of a patient advocacy organization;
15 16	Health Law	Section		two attorneys from the Maryland State Bar Association's experience in representing health professionals;
17 18	<u>and</u>		<u>(iii)</u>	two representatives of professional health care associations;
19			<u>(iv)</u>	two consumers of health care services.
20	<u>(c)</u>	<u>(1)</u>	The Se	ecretary of Health and Mental Hygiene shall:
21			<u>(i)</u>	appoint the chair of the Task Force;
22 23	as necessar	y to fac		establish subcommittees and appoint subcommittee chairs the work of the Task Force; and
24 25	support for	the Ta		in conjunction with the Attorney General, provide staff e from the Department and the health occupation boards.
26 27 28	Force shall diversity of		n <mark>ably r</mark>	e extent practicable, the members appointed to the Task reflect the geographic, racial, ethnic, cultural, and gender
29 30 31			sk Ford	nber of the Task Force may not receive compensation as a ce but is entitled to reimbursement for expenses under the gulations, as provided in the State budget.

1	<u>(d)</u>	In performing its duties, the Task Force shall:
2 3	Force deems	(1) consult with individuals and entities that the chair of the Task appropriate; and
4 5 6	_	(2) consider a broad range of viewpoints including those presented by as representing the interests of patients, licensees, payors, laws, and other groups involved in the disciplinary system.
7	<u>(e)</u>	The Task Force shall issue recommendations regarding:
8 9	objectives of	(1) practices and procedures supporting the fundamental goals and the disciplinary programs of the health occupation boards;
10 11	occupation k	(2) potential changes to the organizational structure of the health poards and the relationship of all boards to the Department; and
12 13 14	-	(3) measures that will otherwise enhance the fair, consistent, and ution of reports concerning substandard, illegal, or unethical practices by professionals.
15	<u>(f)</u>	The issues to be studied by the Task Force include:
16		(1) the extent to which the current disciplinary system:
17 18	incompetent	(i) <u>adequately protects patients from serious risks due to</u> cor unethical practices by licensees;
19 20	ensuring con	(ii) creates a burden to licensees that may be lessened, while national protective and regulatory oversight;
21 22	them;	(iii) uses mentors and the cost to licensees associated with using
23		(iv) adequately provides due process to licensees; and
24 25 26 27		(v) could be modified to more effectively protect patients, competent or unethical behavior by licensees, provide more effective due licensees, and support the professional growth and development of all censees;
28 29	occupation k	(2) potential changes in the disciplinary program of the health poards that will:
30 31	members of	(i) increase the transparency of disciplinary procedures for the public and the regulated community;

$\begin{matrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 3 \end{matrix}$	(ii) improve the complaint process by addressing the roles of the boards, investigators, and assistant attorneys general including who may initiat complaints;
4 5	(iii) increase the consistency and fairness of disciplinary outcomes;
6 7	(iv) a statute of limitations for complaints to be brought against licensees;
8 9	(v) speed the resolution of meritorious complaints and the disposition of proceedings that do not require a public disciplinary order;
10 11 12	(vi) from the time a complaint is filed, specify a reasonable period of time in which a board will conclude its action unless the board can demonstrate delays outside of its control;
13 14	(vii) utilize the Office of Administrative Hearings more effectively;
15 16	(viii) under certain circumstances, expunge disciplinary proceedings from a licensee's file after a specified period of time; and
17 18	(ix) increase the wider adoption of consistent procedures and best practices by all boards including tracking of disciplinary data;
19 20 21	(3) an assessment of whether the current relationship between individual boards, the Department, and the Office of the Attorney General should be modified in connection with the disciplinary process of the board including:
22	(i) oversight of the board by the Department;
23 24	(ii) the role of an assistant attorney general in the investigation process; and
25 26 27	(iii) the length of time an assistant attorney general works for an individual board and the potential of having the assistant attorneys general rotat among the boards; and
28 29 30	(4) the extent to which the current disciplinary system has a differential impact on various groups of licensees and potential strategies for minimizing differences while improving the overall quality of health care services.
31 32	(g) On or before December 1, 2008, the Task Force shall report its final recommendations to the Governor and, subject to § 2–1246 of the State Government

Article, to the Senate Education, Health, and Environmental Affairs Committee and

the House Health and Government Operations Committee.

33

12 HOUSE BILL 811	
SECTION 6. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That Section 5 of this Act she take effect July 1, 2008. It shall remain effective for a period of 1 year and, at the of June 30, 2009, with no further action required by the General Assembly, Section of this Act shall be abrogated and of no further force and effect.	end
SECTION 6-7. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That, subject to provisions of Section 6 of this Act, this Act shall take effect July 1, 2008.	the
Approved:	
Governor	

President of the Senate.

Speaker of the House of Delegates.