E4 SB 986/12 – JPR

By: **Senators Gladden, Jones–Rodwell, and Kelley <u>Kelley, and Forehand</u> Introduced and read first time: January 31, 2014 Assigned to: Judicial Proceedings**

Committee Report: Favorable with amendments Senate action: Adopted with floor amendments Read second time: March 14, 2014

CHAPTER _____

1 AN ACT concerning

2 Public Safety - Photo and Lineup Eyewitness Identification - Procedures

3 FOR the purpose of requiring, on or before a certain date, each law enforcement 4 agency in the State to adopt and implement a certain policy relating to certain $\mathbf{5}$ identification procedures and file a copy with the Department of State Police; 6 requiring the Department, on or before a certain date, to compile certain written 7 policies; requiring the Department to allow public inspection of certain policies; 8 requiring that a certain identification procedure be conducted by a certain 9 administrator; requiring the Police Training Commission to adopt certain 10 standards and conduct certain training programs: requiring certain 11 identification procedures to be conducted in a certain manner; requiring that a 12 certain record of a certain identification procedure be made; requiring evidence of a failure to comply with this Act to be dealt with by a certain court in a 13certain manner; defining certain terms; providing for the application of this Act; 14 providing for a delayed effective date; and generally relating to evewitness 15identifications. 16

- 17 BY adding to
- 18 Article Public Safety
- 19 Section 3–506(d) and (e) and 3–506.1
- 20 Annotated Code of Maryland
- 21 (2011 Replacement Volume and 2013 Supplement)
- 22 SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF 23 MARYLAND, That the Laws of Maryland read as follows:

EXPLANATION: CAPITALS INDICATE MATTER ADDED TO EXISTING LAW.

[Brackets] indicate matter deleted from existing law.

Underlining indicates amendments to bill.

Strike out indicates matter stricken from the bill by amendment or deleted from the law by amendment.



	2 SENATE BILL 860
1	Article – Public Safety
2	3–506.
$\frac{3}{4}$	(D) (1) ON OR BEFORE August 1, 2014 <u>January 1, 2015</u> , each law enforcement agency in the State shall:
$5 \\ 6$	(I) <u>1.</u> <u>Adopt the Police Training Commission's</u> <u>Eyewitness Identification Model Policy; or</u>
7 8 9	<u>2.</u> ADOPT AND IMPLEMENT A WRITTEN POLICY RELATING TO IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURES THAT COMPLIES WITH § 3–506.1 OF THIS SUBTITLE; AND
10 11	(II) FILE A COPY OF THE WRITTEN POLICY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE POLICE.
$12 \\ 13 \\ 14 \\ 15$	(2) ON OR BEFORE December 31, 2014 February 1, 2015, THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE POLICE SHALL COMPILE THE WRITTEN POLICIES RELATING TO IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURES OF EACH LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY IN THE STATE.
$\frac{16}{17}$	(3) THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE POLICE SHALL ALLOW PUBLIC INSPECTION OF EACH POLICY COMPILED UNDER THIS SUBSECTION.
18 19 20	(E) THE POLICE TRAINING COMMISSION SHALL ADOPT STANDARDS AND CONDUCT TRAINING PROGRAMS RELATING TO IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURES THAT COMPLY WITH § 3-506.1 OF THIS SUBTITLE.
21	3–506.1.
$\begin{array}{c} 22\\ 23 \end{array}$	(A) (1) IN THIS SECTION THE FOLLOWING WORDS HAVE THE MEANINGS INDICATED.
$\frac{24}{25}$	(2) "ADMINISTRATOR" MEANS THE PERSON CONDUCTING AN IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE.
$\frac{26}{27}$	(3) "BLIND" MEANS THE ADMINISTRATOR DOES NOT KNOW THE IDENTITY OF THE SUSPECT.
28 29 30	(4) "BLINDED" MEANS THE ADMINISTRATOR MAY KNOW WHO THE SUSPECT IS BUT DOES NOT KNOW WHICH LINEUP MEMBER IS BEING VIEWED BY THE EYEWITNESS.

1 (5) "EYEWITNESS" MEANS A PERSON WHO OBSERVES ANOTHER 2 PERSON AT OR NEAR THE SCENE OF AN OFFENSE.

3 (6) "FILLER" MEANS A PERSON OR A PHOTOGRAPH OF A PERSON
4 WHO IS NOT SUSPECTED OF AN OFFENSE AND IS INCLUDED IN AN
5 IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE.

6 **(7) "FOLDER SHUFFLE METHOD" MEANS A SYSTEM FOR** 7 **CONDUCTING A PHOTO LINEUP THAT:**

8 (I) COMPLIES WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF THIS SECTION;
9 AND

10 (II) IS CONDUCTED BY PLACING PHOTOGRAPHS IN 11 FOLDERS, RANDOMLY NUMBERING THE FOLDERS, SHUFFLING THE FOLDERS, 12 AND THEN PRESENTING THE FOLDERS SEQUENTIALLY SO THAT THE 13 ADMINISTRATOR CANNOT SEE OR TRACK WHICH PHOTOGRAPH IS BEING 14 PRESENTED TO THE EYEWITNESS UNTIL AFTER THE PROCEDURE IS 15 COMPLETED.

16 (8) "IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE" MEANS A PROCEDURE IN 17 WHICH A LIVE LINEUP IS CONDUCTED OR AN ARRAY OF PHOTOGRAPHS, 18 INCLUDING A PHOTOGRAPH OF A SUSPECTED PERPETRATOR SUSPECT AND 19 ADDITIONAL PHOTOGRAPHS OF OTHER PERSONS NOT SUSPECTED OF THE 20 OFFENSE, IS DISPLAYED TO AN EYEWITNESS IN HARD COPY FORM OR BY 21 COMPUTER FOR THE PURPOSE OF DETERMINING WHETHER THE EYEWITNESS 22 IDENTIFIES THE SUSPECT AS THE PERPETRATOR.

(9) "IDENTIFICATION STATEMENT" MEANS A STATEMENT AS TO
 WHETHER THE EYEWITNESS BELIEVES THAT THE PERPETRATOR HAS BEEN
 IDENTIFIED DURING THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE DOCUMENTED
 STATEMENT THAT IS SOUGHT BY THE ADMINISTRATOR WHEN AN
 IDENTIFICATION IS MADE:

28 (I) FROM THE EYEWITNESS;

29(II)IN THE OWN WORDS OF THE EYEWITNESS, DESCRIBING30THE EYEWITNESS'S CONFIDENCE LEVEL THAT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED IS THE31PERPETRATOR OF THE CRIME;

32 (III) GIVEN AT THE TIME OF THE VIEWING BY THE 33 EYEWITNESS DURING THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE; AND

	4 SENATE BILL 860
$rac{1}{2}$	(III) (IV) GIVEN BEFORE THE EYEWITNESS IS GIVEN FEEDBACK.
3	(10) "Live lineup" means a procedure in which a group of
4	PERSONS IS DISPLAYED TO AN EYEWITNESS FOR THE PURPOSE OF
$\overline{5}$	DETERMINING IF THE EYEWITNESS IS ABLE TO IDENTIFY THE PERPETRATOR OF
6	THE CRIME PERPETRATOR IS PLACED AMONG A GROUP OF OTHER PERSONS
7	WHOSE GENERAL APPEARANCE RESEMBLES THE PERPETRATOR.
8	(11) "PERPETRATOR" MEANS A PERSON WHO COMMITTED AN
9	OFFENSE.
10	(12) "SUSPECT" MEANS A PERSON WHO IS SUSPECTED OF
11	COMMITTING AN OFFENSE.
12	(B) (1) AN IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE SHALL BE CONDUCTED BY A
13	BLIND OR BLINDED ADMINISTRATOR.
14	(2) AN ADMINISTRATOR MAY BE BLINDED THROUGH THE USE OF:
15	(I) AN AUTOMATED COMPUTER PROGRAM THAT PREVENTS
16	THE ADMINISTRATOR FROM SEEING WHICH PHOTOS THE EYEWITNESS IS
17	VIEWING UNTIL AFTER THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE IS COMPLETED; OR
18	(II) THE FOLDER SHUFFLE METHOD.
19	(3) BEFORE AN IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE IS CONDUCTED, AN
20	EYEWITNESS SHALL BE INSTRUCTED, WITHOUT OTHER EYEWITNESSES
$\begin{array}{c} 21 \\ 22 \end{array}$	PRESENT, AND ACKNOWLEDGE THE RECEIPT OF THE INSTRUCTIONS IN WRITING THAT:
23	(I) THE PERPETRATOR MAY OR MAY NOT BE AMONG THE
24	PERSONS IN THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE;
25	(II) THE ADMINISTRATOR DOES NOT KNOW WHO THE
26	PERPETRATOR IS;
27	(III) THE EYEWITNESS SHOULD NOT FEEL COMPELLED TO
28	MAKE AN IDENTIFICATION;
29	(IV) THE INVESTIGATION WILL CONTINUE WHETHER OR NOT
30	AN IDENTIFICATION IS MADE;

(V) EXCLUDING INNOCENT PERSONS IS AS IMPORTANT AS
IDENTIFYING THE PERPETRATOR; AND
(VI) THE EYEWITNESS IS NOT TO DISCUSS THE
IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE OR THE RESULTS OF THE PROCEDURE WITH
OTHER EYEWITNESSES INVOLVED IN THE CASE AND SHOULD NOT SPEAK TO THE
MEDIA THAT THE PERPETRATOR MAY OR MAY NOT BE AMONG THE PERSONS IN
THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE.
(4) IN AN IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE, EACH INDIVIDUAL OR
PHOTO SHALL BE:
(I) PRESENTED TO AN EYEWITNESS:
1. SEQUENTIALLY;
2. WITH EACH INDIVIDUAL OR PHOTO PRESENTED
TO THE EVEWITNESS SEPARATELY; AND
3. IN A PREVIOUSLY DETERMINED ORDER; AND
(II) REMOVED BEFORE THE NEXT INDIVIDUAL OR PHOTO IS
PRESENTED TO THE EYEWITNESS.
(5) AS THE INDIVIDUALS OR PHOTOS ARE PRESENTED TO AN
EYEWITNESS, THE ADMINISTRATOR SHALL DOCUMENT IN WRITING ALL
IDENTIFICATION STATEMENTS MADE BY THE EYEWITNESS.
(6) THE EYEWITNESS MAY NOT BE GIVEN EITHER POSITIVE OR
NEGATIVE FEEDBACK AS TO THE ACCURACY OR INACCURACY OF AN
IDENTIFICATION BY THE EYEWITNESS TO THE FULLEST EXTENT PRACTICABLE.
(7) ONLY ONE GUODEOT MAY BE INCLUDED IN EACH
(7) ONLY ONE SUSPECT MAY BE INCLUDED IN EACH
IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE.
(4) WHEN AN IDENTIFICATION IS MADE IN A LIVE LINEUP OR
PHOTO ARRAY, THE ADMINISTRATOR SHALL DOCUMENT IN WRITING ALL
IDENTIFICATION STATEMENTS MADE BY THE EYEWITNESS.
IDENTIFICATION STATEMENTS MADE DI THE ETEWITNESS.
(C) IN AN IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE:
(-,
(1) EACH FILLER SHALL RESEMBLE THE DESCRIPTION OF THE
PERPETRATOR GIVEN BY THE EYEWITNESS IN SIGNIFICANT PHYSICAL

31 FEATURES, INCLUDING ANY UNIQUE OR UNUSUAL FEATURES; AND

1 (2) AT LEAST FIVE FILLERS, IN ADDITION TO THE SUSPECT 2 PERPETRATOR, SHALL BE INCLUDED WHEN AN ARRAY OF PHOTOGRAPHS IS 3 DISPLAYED TO AN EYEWITNESS OR A LIVE LINEUP IS CONDUCTED FOR AN 4 EYEWITNESS; AND

5 (3) AT LEAST FOUR FILLERS, IN ADDITION TO THE PERPETRATOR, 6 SHALL BE INCLUDED IN A LIVE LINEUP.

7 (D) IF AN EYEWITNESS HAS PREVIOUSLY PARTICIPATED IN AN 8 IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE IN CONNECTION WITH THE IDENTIFICATION OF 9 ANOTHER PERSON SUSPECTED OF INVOLVEMENT IN THE OFFENSE, THE 10 FILLERS IN THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE SHALL BE DIFFERENT FROM THE 11 FILLERS USED IN ANY PRIOR IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE.

12 (E) IF THERE ARE MULTIPLE EYEWITNESSES:

13(1) THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE SHALL BE CONDUCTED14SEPARATELY FOR EACH EYEWITNESS;

15 (2) THE SUSPECT SHALL BE PLACED IN A DIFFERENT POSITION
 16 FOR EACH IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE CONDUCTED FOR EACH EYEWITNESS;
 17 AND

18(3) THE EYEWITNESSES MAY NOT BE ALLOWED TO COMMUNICATE19WITH EACH OTHER UNTIL ALL IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURES HAVE BEEN20COMPLETED.

21(F)(1)UNLESS NOT PRACTICAL, THE ADMINISTRATOR SHALL MAKE22A VIDEO OR AUDIO RECORD OF THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE.

23 (2) EXCEPT AS PROVIDED IN PARAGRAPH (3) (2) OF THIS 24 SUBSECTION, THE ADMINISTRATOR SHALL MAKE A WRITTEN RECORD OF THE 25 IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE THAT INCLUDES THE FOLLOWING INFORMATION:

26(I) ALL IDENTIFICATION AND NONIDENTIFICATION27RESULTS OBTAINED DURING THE IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURES;

28 (II) THE SIGNED IDENTIFICATION STATEMENT OF THE 29 EYEWITNESS IN THE EYEWITNESS'S OWN WORDS;

30(III) THE NAMES OF ALL PERSONS PRESENT AT THE31IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE;

(IV**)** 1 THE DATE AND TIME OF THE **IDENTIFICATION** $\mathbf{2}$ **PROCEDURE;** 3 **(**V**)** ANY EYEWITNESS IDENTIFICATION OF A FILLER; AND 4 (VI) ALL PHOTOGRAPHS USED IN THE IDENTIFICATION $\mathbf{5}$ **PROCEDURE.** 6 (3) (2) IF A VIDEO OR AUDIO RECORD OF THE IDENTIFICATION 7 PROCEDURE CAPTURES ALL OF THE INFORMATION IN PARAGRAPH (2) (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION, A WRITTEN RECORD IS NOT REQUIRED. 8 9 (G) FOR AN IDENTIFICATION PROCEDURE: 10 EVIDENCE OF A FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE PROVISIONS (1) 11 OF THIS SECTION SHALL BE CONSIDERED BY THE COURT THAT ADJUDICATES A 12**MOTION TO SUPPRESS THE IDENTIFICATION BY THE EYEWITNESS;** 13(2) EVIDENCE OF A FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE PROVISIONS 14OF THIS SECTION IS ADMISSIBLE IN SUPPORT OF A CLAIM OF EYEWITNESS 15**MISIDENTIFICATION IF THE EVIDENCE IS OTHERWISE ADMISSIBLE; AND** 16 (3) WHEN EVIDENCE OF A FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE 17PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION IS PRESENTED AT TRIAL, THE JURY SHALL BE 18 INSTRUCTED THAT THE JURY MAY CONSIDER CREDIBLE EVIDENCE OF 19NONCOMPLIANCE IN DETERMINING THE RELIABILITY OF AN EYEWITNESS 20**IDENTIFICATION.** SECTION 2. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall be 2122construed to apply only prospectively and may not be applied or interpreted to have any effect on or application to any criminal case commenced before the effective date of 2324this Act.

25 SECTION 2. 3. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall take 26 effect July 1, 2014 January 1, 2015 October 1, 2014.