## **SENATE BILL 192**

E4 SB 762/22 – JPR CF 3lr0697

By: Senator Sydnor

Introduced and read first time: January 20, 2023

Assigned to: Judicial Proceedings

## A BILL ENTITLED

|                               | A DILL ENTITLED  |
|-------------------------------|--|
| 1                             | AN ACT concerning  |
| 2 3                           | Criminal Procedure – Facial Recognition Technology – Requirements,<br>Procedures, and Prohibitions   |
| 4<br>5<br>6                   | FOR the purpose of establishing requirements, procedures, and prohibitions relating to the use of facial recognition technology by a law enforcement agency under certain circumstances; and generally relating to facial recognition technology.                          |
| 7<br>8<br>9<br>10<br>11<br>12 | BY adding to  Article – Criminal Procedure Section 2–501 through 2–510 to be under the new subtitle "Subtitle 5. Facial Recognition Technology" Annotated Code of Maryland (2018 Replacement Volume and 2022 Supplement)   |
| 13<br>14                      | SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF MARYLAND, That the Laws of Maryland read as follows:   |
| 15                            | Article – Criminal Procedure   |
| 16                            | SUBTITLE 5. FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY.   |
| 17                            | 2–501.   |
| 18<br>19                      | (A) IN THIS SUBTITLE THE FOLLOWING WORDS HAVE THE MEANINGS INDICATED.  |
| 20<br>21<br>22<br>23          | (B) (1) "FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY" MEANS A COMPUTER PROGRAM, SERVICE, OR OTHER TECHNOLOGY THAT ANALYZES FACIAL FEATURES AND IS USED BY OR AT THE DIRECTION OF A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY FOR THE IDENTIFICATION, VERIFICATION, OR PERSISTENT TRACKING OF INDIVIDUALS IN |

EXPLANATION: CAPITALS INDICATE MATTER ADDED TO EXISTING LAW.

[Brackets] indicate matter deleted from existing law.



- 1 STILL OR VIDEO IMAGES FOR USE IN CRIMINAL INVESTIGATIONS.
- 2 (2) "FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY" DOES NOT INCLUDE
- 3 TECHNOLOGY:
- 4 (I) USED ONLY FOR THE ANALYSIS OF FACIAL FEATURES TO
- 5 GRANT OR DENY ACCESS TO AN ELECTRONIC DEVICE; OR
- 6 (II) THAT USES AN AUTOMATED OR SEMIAUTOMATED PROCESS
- 7 ONLY FOR THE PURPOSE OF REDACTING A RECORDING OR AN IMAGE FOR RELEASE
- 8 OR DISCLOSURE OUTSIDE A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY TO PROTECT THE PRIVACY
- 9 OF A SUBJECT DEPICTED IN THE RECORDING OR IMAGE IF THE PROCESS DOES NOT
- 10 GENERATE OR RESULT IN THE RETENTION OF ANY BIOMETRIC DATA OR
- 11 SURVEILLANCE INFORMATION.
- 12 (C) "LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY" HAS THE MEANING STATED IN § 2–101
- 13 OF THE PUBLIC SAFETY ARTICLE.
- 14 **2–502**.
- 15 (A) EXCEPT AS OTHERWISE PROVIDED IN THIS SECTION, RESULTS
- 16 GENERATED BY FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY MAY NOT BE INTRODUCED IN A
- 17 CRIMINAL PROCEEDING OR IN A DELINQUENCY PROCEEDING UNDER TITLE 3,
- 18 SUBTITLE 8A OF THE COURTS ARTICLE.
- 19 (B) (1) SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (2) OF THIS SUBSECTION, RESULTS
- 20 GENERATED BY FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY MAY BE CONSIDERED OR
- 21 INTRODUCED AS EVIDENCE IN CONNECTION WITH A CRIMINAL PROCEEDING ONLY
- 22 FOR THE PURPOSE OF ESTABLISHING PROBABLE CAUSE OR POSITIVE
- 23 **IDENTIFICATION:**
- 24 (I) IN CONNECTION WITH THE ISSUANCE OF A WARRANT; OR
- 25 (II) AT A PRELIMINARY HEARING.
- 26 (2) (I) SUBJECT TO SUBPARAGRAPH (II) OF THIS PARAGRAPH,
- 27 RESULTS GENERATED BY FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY MAY NOT SERVE AS
- 28 THE SOLE BASIS TO ESTABLISH PROBABLE CAUSE OR THE POSITIVE
- 29 IDENTIFICATION OF AN INDIVIDUAL IN A CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION OR
- 30 **PROCEEDING.**
- 31 (II) PROBABLE CAUSE OR POSITIVE IDENTIFICATION MAY BE
- 32 ESTABLISHED USING FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY ONLY IF THE RESULTS

- 1 ARE SUPPORTED BY ADDITIONAL, INDEPENDENTLY OBTAINED EVIDENCE
- 2 ESTABLISHING PROBABLE CAUSE OR A POSITIVE IDENTIFICATION.
- 3 **2-503**.
- 4 (A) (1) A POLICE OFFICER OR OTHER EMPLOYEE OR AGENT OF A LAW
- 5 ENFORCEMENT AGENCY MAY NOT, IN THE FURTHERANCE OF A CRIMINAL
- 6 INVESTIGATION:
- 7 (I) USE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY TO INVESTIGATE A
- 8 CRIME OTHER THAN THE COMMISSION OF OR THE ATTEMPT TO COMMIT:
- 9 1. A CRIME OF VIOLENCE AS DEFINED IN § 14–101 OF
- 10 THE CRIMINAL LAW ARTICLE;
- 2. A HUMAN TRAFFICKING OFFENSE UNDER TITLE 3,
- 12 SUBTITLE 11 OF THE CRIMINAL LAW ARTICLE; OR
- 3. A CRIMINAL ACT INVOLVING CIRCUMSTANCES
- 14 PRESENTING A SUBSTANTIAL AND ONGOING THREAT TO PUBLIC SAFETY OR
- 15 NATIONAL SECURITY;
- 16 (II) ANALYZE AN IMAGE OR A RECORDING OF AN INDIVIDUAL:
- 1. ENGAGED IN ACTIVITY PROTECTED UNDER THE
- 18 UNITED STATES CONSTITUTION, THE MARYLAND CONSTITUTION, OR THE
- 19 MARYLAND DECLARATION OF RIGHTS, UNLESS THERE IS REASONABLE SUSPICION
- 20 TO BELIEVE THAT THE INDIVIDUAL HAS COMMITTED, IS IN THE PROCESS OF
- 21 COMMITTING, OR IS ABOUT TO COMMIT A CRIME;
- 22 2. SUSPECTED OF BEING A JUVENILE WHO IS
- 23 INELIGIBLE TO BE CHARGED WITH A CRIMINAL ACT UNDER § 3–8A–03 OF THE
- 24 COURTS ARTICLE; OR
- 25 3. WHO IS NOT INTENDED TO BE IDENTIFIED;
- 26 (III) USE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY TO ANALYZE A
- 27 SKETCH OR MANUALLY PRODUCED IMAGE;
- 28 (IV) DISCLOSE TO A WITNESS IN THE CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION,
- 29 PRIOR TO THE WITNESS PARTICIPATING IN A LIVE IDENTIFICATION OR PHOTO
- 30 ARRAY IDENTIFICATION, THAT A PARTICULAR SUSPECT OR IMAGE OF A SUSPECT
- 31 WAS IDENTIFIED USING FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY; OR

- 1 (V) USE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY FOR THE PURPOSE 2 OF LIVE OR REAL-TIME IDENTIFICATION OF AN IMAGE OR A RECORDING.
- 3 (2) AN IMAGE BEING EVALUATED USING FACIAL RECOGNITION 4 TECHNOLOGY MAY BE COMPARED ONLY TO IMAGES CONTAINED IN:
- 5 (I) THE DATABASE OF IMAGES OF DRIVER'S LICENSE AND
- 6 IDENTIFICATION CARD PHOTOS MAINTAINED BY THE MOTOR VEHICLE
- 7 ADMINISTRATION OR THE DEPARTMENT OF MOTOR VEHICLES OF ANOTHER STATE;
- 8 **OR**
- 9 (II) A DATABASE OF MUGSHOT PHOTOS MAINTAINED BY A
- 10 LOCAL, STATE, OR FEDERAL LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY OR A LAW ENFORCEMENT
- 11 AGENCY OF ANOTHER COUNTRY.
- 12 (3) BEFORE BEING USED FOR ANY PURPOSE IN RELATION TO A
- 13 CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION, A RESULT GENERATED BY FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 14 TECHNOLOGY SHALL BE INDEPENDENTLY VERIFIED BY AN INDIVIDUAL WHO HAS
- 15 COMPLETED TRAINING AND REQUIRED PROFICIENCY TESTING IN ACCORDANCE
- 16 WITH § 2–505 OF THIS SUBTITLE.
- 17 (B) A POLICE OFFICER OR OTHER EMPLOYEE OR AGENT OF A LAW
- 18 ENFORCEMENT AGENCY MAY NOT USE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY TO
- 19 IDENTIFY AN INDIVIDUAL SOLELY BASED ON:
- 20 (1) THE POLICE OFFICER'S, EMPLOYEE'S, OR AGENT'S PERSONAL
- 21 INTEREST NOT RELATED TO LEGITIMATE DUTIES OR OBJECTIVES OF THE LAW
- 22 ENFORCEMENT AGENCY;
- 23 (2) THE INDIVIDUAL'S POLITICAL OR SOCIAL BELIEFS OR ACTIVITIES;
- 24 (3) THE INDIVIDUAL'S PARTICIPATION IN LAWFUL ACTIVITIES; OR
- 25 (4) THE INDIVIDUAL'S RACE, COLOR, RELIGIOUS BELIEFS, SEXUAL
- 26 ORIENTATION, GENDER, DISABILITY, NATIONAL ORIGIN, OR STATUS AS BEING
- 27 HOMELESS.
- 28 (C) (1) EXCEPT AS PROVIDED IN PARAGRAPH (2) OF THIS SUBSECTION
- 29 AND SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (3) OF THIS SUBSECTION, A RESULT GENERATED BY
- 30 FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY IN VIOLATION OF THIS SECTION AND ALL
- 31 OTHER EVIDENCE SUBSEQUENTLY DERIVED FROM THE RESULT MAY NOT BE
- 32 INTRODUCED BY THE STATE FOR ANY PURPOSE IN A CRIMINAL COURT PROCEEDING

- OR IN A JUVENILE COURT PROCEEDING UNDER TITLE 3, SUBTITLE 8A OF THE COURTS ARTICLE.
- 3 (2) EVIDENCE DERIVED FROM A RESULT GENERATED IN VIOLATION
- 4 OF SUBSECTION (A)(1) OF THIS SECTION MAY BE INTRODUCED FOR A PURPOSE
- 5 DESCRIBED IN § 2–502 OF THIS SUBTITLE IF THE COURT FINDS THAT THE EVIDENCE
- 6 WOULD OTHERWISE BE SUBJECT TO A LEGALLY VALID EXCEPTION TO THE
- 7 EXCLUSIONARY RULE.
- 8 (3) This subsection may not be construed to allow the use
- 9 OF A RESULT GENERATED USING FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY TO BE
- 10 INTRODUCED AS EVIDENCE IN A CRIMINAL TRIAL OR IN AN ADJUDICATORY HEARING
- 11 HELD UNDER § 3–8A–18 OF THE COURTS ARTICLE.
- 12 **2–504.**
- 13 THE STATE SHALL DISCLOSE, IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE MARYLAND RULES
- 14 REGARDING DISCOVERY, WHETHER FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY HAS BEEN
- 15 USED IN AN INVESTIGATION RELEVANT TO A CRIMINAL COURT PROCEEDING OR
- 16 JUVENILE COURT PROCEEDING UNDER TITLE 3, SUBTITLE 8A OF THE COURTS
- 17 ARTICLE AND ALL RESULTS GENERATED FROM THE USE OF THE FACIAL
- 18 RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY.
- 19 **2–505**.
- 20 (A) A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY THAT USES OR CONTRACTS FOR THE USE
- 21 OF FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY SHALL DESIGNATE AN EMPLOYEE OF THE
- 22 LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY TO BE RESPONSIBLE FOR OVERSEEING AND
- 23 ADMINISTERING THE USE OF FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY IN COMPLIANCE
- 24 WITH THIS SUBTITLE AS WELL AS APPLICABLE LOCAL LAWS, REGULATIONS, AND
- 25 POLICIES.
- 26 (B) (1) ON OR BEFORE OCTOBER 1 EACH YEAR, A LAW ENFORCEMENT
- 27 AGENCY THAT USES OR CONTRACTS FOR THE USE OF FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 28 TECHNOLOGY SHALL COMPLETE AN AUDIT TO DETERMINE COMPLIANCE WITH THIS
- 29 SUBTITLE AS WELL AS APPLICABLE LOCAL LAWS, REGULATIONS, AND POLICIES.
- 30 (2) The results of the audit conducted under this
- 31 SUBSECTION, INCLUDING ANY RECORDS, DATA, PAPERS, OR MATERIALS EVALUATED
- 32 AS PART OF THE AUDIT, SHALL BE:
- 33 (I) MAINTAINED BY THE LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY FOR AT
- 34 LEAST 3 YEARS AFTER COMPLETION OF THE AUDIT, AFTER WHICH THE LAW

## 1 ENFORCEMENT AGENCY MAY DESTROY ALL AUDIT MATERIALS; AND

- 2 (II) UNLESS ALL AUDIT MATERIALS HAVE BEEN DESTROYED IN
- 3 ACCORDANCE WITH ITEM (I) OF THIS PARAGRAPH, DISCLOSED IF REQUESTED BY:
- 4 1. THE ATTORNEY GENERAL;
- 5 2. THE PUBLIC DEFENDER;
- 6 3. A STATE'S ATTORNEY;
- 7 4. A UNITED STATES ATTORNEY; OR
- 8 5. A DESIGNEE OF AN INDIVIDUAL DESCRIBED IN ITEMS
- 9 1 THROUGH 4 OF THIS ITEM.
- 10 (C) A POLICE OFFICER OR OTHER EMPLOYEE OR AGENT OF A LAW
- 11 ENFORCEMENT AGENCY AUTHORIZED TO USE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY
- 12 IN THE COURSE OF CRIMINAL INVESTIGATIONS SHALL ANNUALLY COMPLETE
- 13 TRAINING AND PROFICIENCY TESTING ADMINISTERED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF
- 14 Public Safety and Correctional Services under § 2–506 of this subtitle.
- 15 **2–506.**
- 16 (A) THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES,
- 17 IN CONSULTATION WITH ANY OTHER RELEVANT STATE AGENCY, SHALL:
- 18 (1) ADOPT AND PUBLISH A MODEL STATEWIDE POLICY REGARDING
- 19 THE USE OF FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY;
- 20 (2) DEVELOP AND ADMINISTER A TRAINING PROGRAM AND
- 21 PROFICIENCY TESTING REGARDING THE USE OF FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 22 TECHNOLOGY IN THE COURSE OF CRIMINAL INVESTIGATIONS, INCLUDING TRAINING
- 23 AND TESTING ON CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND IMPLICIT BIAS;
- 24 (3) REVIEW AND APPROVE A SINGLE FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 25 TECHNOLOGY FOR USE BY LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES IN THE STATE; AND
- 26 (4) PUBLISH ON ITS PUBLIC WEBSITE:
- 27 (I) THE NAME, VERSION, AND VENDOR OF THE FACIAL
- 28 RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY CURRENTLY APPROVED FOR USE UNDER ITEM (3) OF
- 29 THIS SUBSECTION; AND

- 1 (II) THE NAMES, VERSIONS, AND VENDORS OF ALL FACIAL
- 2 RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGIES THAT THE DEPARTMENT HAS PREVIOUSLY
- 3 APPROVED FOR USE UNDER ITEM (3) OF THIS SUBSECTION.
- 4 (B) A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY MAY NOT USE OR CONTRACT FOR THE
- 5 USE OF FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY FOR USE IN CRIMINAL INVESTIGATIONS
- 6 UNLESS:
- 7 (1) THE USE IS IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE MODEL STATEWIDE POLICY
- 8 REGARDING THE USE OF FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY ADOPTED AND
- 9 PUBLISHED UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION; AND
- 10 (2) THE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY IS CURRENTLY
- 11 APPROVED FOR USE BY THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY AND CORRECTIONAL
- 12 SERVICES UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION.
- 13 **2–507.**
- THIS SUBTITLE MAY NOT BE CONSTRUED TO RESTRICT THE USE OF FACIAL
- 15 RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY FOR THE PURPOSE OF:
- 16 (1) IDENTIFYING A MISSING OR DECEASED PERSON OR A PERSON WHO
- 17 IS INCAPACITATED AND UNABLE TO OTHERWISE PROVIDE THE PERSON'S OWN
- 18 **IDENTITY**;
- 19 (2) REDACTING A RECORDING OR AN IMAGE FOR RELEASE OR
- 20 DISCLOSURE TO PROTECT THE PRIVACY OF AN INDIVIDUAL DEPICTED IN A
- 21 RECORDING OR AN IMAGE;
- 22 (3) FORENSIC ANALYSIS OF ELECTRONIC MEDIA SEIZED BY LAW
- 23 ENFORCEMENT IN RELATION TO A SPECIFIC INVESTIGATION IF THE PERSON
- 24 IDENTIFIED IN THE ELECTRONIC MEDIA IS NOT THE SUBJECT OF CRIMINAL
- 25 CHARGES RESULTING FROM THE FORENSIC ANALYSIS;
- 26 (4) ENHANCING SECURITY SYSTEMS FOR PREVENTING
- 27 UNAUTHORIZED ACCESS TO INFORMATION, GOODS, MATERIALS, AREAS, OR OTHER
- 28 PROPERTIES UNDER THE CUSTODY OR CARE OF A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY; OR
- 29 (5) CONDUCTING OTHERWISE LEGITIMATE ACTIVITY UNRELATED TO
- 30 A CRIMINAL INVESTIGATION.
- 31 **2–508.**

- 1 (A) A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY THAT USES FACIAL RECOGNITION 2 TECHNOLOGY SHALL ADOPT AND MAINTAIN A USE AND DATA MANAGEMENT POLICY.
- 3 (B) A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY THAT DEVELOPS A POLICY UNDER
- 4 SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION SHALL POST A COPY OF THE POLICY ON THE
- 5 AGENCY'S PUBLIC WEBSITE.
- 6 **2-509**.
- 7 A PERSON MAY BRING A CIVIL ACTION AGAINST A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY
- 8 TO COMPEL COMPLIANCE WITH THIS SUBTITLE.
- 9 **2-510.**
- 10 (A) ON OR BEFORE FEBRUARY 1 EACH YEAR, A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY
- 11 USING OR CONTRACTING FOR THE USE OF FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY
- 12 SHALL PREPARE AND PUBLISH AN ANNUAL REPORT THAT DISCLOSES INFORMATION
- 13 FOR THE PRIOR CALENDAR YEAR, INCLUDING:
- 14 (1) THE TOTAL NUMBER OF FACIAL RECOGNITION SEARCHES
- 15 PERFORMED BY THE LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY AND THE TYPE OF CRIME OR
- 16 INCIDENT ASSOCIATED WITH EACH USE;
- 17 (2) THE TOTAL NUMBER OF POSSIBLE MATCHES RETURNED;
- 18 (3) ANY DATA BREACHES OR UNAUTHORIZED USES OF FACIAL
- 19 RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY UNDER THE LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY'S CONTROL;
- 20 (4) THE EXTENT OF THE USE OF THE FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 21 TECHNOLOGY;
- 22 (5) A DESCRIPTION OF THE PURPOSE OF THE FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 23 TECHNOLOGY, INCLUDING:
- 24 (I) WHETHER RESULTS FROM THE FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 25 TECHNOLOGY WERE USED TO SUPPORT A DECISION OR AS THE SOLE BASIS FOR
- 26 MAKING A DECISION; AND
- 27 (II) THE INTENDED BENEFITS OF THE USE OF THE FACIAL
- 28 RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY, INCLUDING ANY DATA OR RESEARCH
- 29 DEMONSTRATING THE INTENDED BENEFITS;

- 1 (6) A DESCRIPTION OF THE GENERAL CAPABILITIES AND
- 2 LIMITATIONS OF THE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY, INCLUDING
- 3 REASONABLY FORESEEABLE CAPABILITIES OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THE CURRENT
- 4 USE OF THE FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY;
- 5 (7) THE TYPE OF DATA INPUTS THAT THE FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 6 TECHNOLOGY USED;
- 7 (8) THE TYPE OF RESULTS THAT THE FACIAL RECOGNITION
- 8 TECHNOLOGY GENERATED; AND
- 9 (9) ANY KNOWN OR REASONABLY SUSPECTED VIOLATIONS OF THE
- 10 MODEL STATEWIDE POLICY OR USE AND DATA MANAGEMENT POLICY, INCLUDING
- 11 COMPLAINTS ALLEGING VIOLATIONS.
- 12 (B) ON OR BEFORE MAY 1 EACH YEAR, A LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCY
- 13 REQUIRED TO PREPARE A REPORT UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION SHALL
- 14 SUBMIT THE REPORT TO THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF CRIME PREVENTION,
- 15 YOUTH, AND VICTIM SERVICES.
- 16 (C) ON OR BEFORE OCTOBER 1 EACH YEAR, THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF
- 17 CRIME PREVENTION, YOUTH, AND VICTIM SERVICES SHALL SUBMIT TO THE
- 18 GOVERNOR AND, IN ACCORDANCE WITH § 2–1257 OF THE STATE GOVERNMENT
- 19 ARTICLE, THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY A REPORT CONSISTING OF THE INFORMATION
- 20 REPORTED BY LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES UNDER SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS
- 21 SECTION, DISAGGREGATED BY AGENCY.
- SECTION 2. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall take effect
- 23 October 1, 2023.