#### M3, M1

4lr1884 CF SB 653

# By: Delegates Love, Charkoudian, Foley, Fraser-Hidalgo, J. Long, Ruth, and Stewart

Introduced and read first time: February 7, 2024 Assigned to: Environment and Transportation

Committee Report: Favorable with amendments House action: Adopted Read second time: March 8, 2024

CHAPTER \_\_\_\_\_

### 1 AN ACT concerning

# Standing – Environmental and Natural Resources Protection Proceedings (Clean Water Justice Act of 2024)

4 FOR the purpose of providing certain persons <del>and associations</del> standing in certain  $\mathbf{5}$ environmental and natural resources protection proceedings, including proceedings 6 arising under provisions of law relating to water quality and water resources 7protection, subject to certain conditions; authorizing certain persons that meet 8 certain standing requirements to bring certain civil actions under certain 9 circumstances; requiring a plaintiff, under certain circumstances, to give certain 10 notice and provide certain documentation to the Department of the Environment and 11 the Attorney General in a certain manner and to file a certain affidavit; authorizing 12a court to grant certain relief, award certain costs of litigation, and impose certain 13 civil penalties in certain civil actions under certain circumstances; authorizing 14 certain persons that meet certain standing requirements to intervene in certain 15proceedings under certain circumstances; and generally relating to standing in 16 certain environmental and natural resources protection proceedings.

### 17 BY adding to

- 18 Article Environment
- Section 1–901 through <u>1–905</u> <u>1–904</u> to be under the new subtitle "Subtitle 9. Clean
   Water Justice Act"
- 21 Annotated Code of Maryland
- 22 (2013 Replacement Volume and 2023 Supplement)

EXPLANATION: CAPITALS INDICATE MATTER ADDED TO EXISTING LAW.

[Brackets] indicate matter deleted from existing law.

<u>Underlining</u> indicates amendments to bill.

Strike out indicates matter stricken from the bill by amendment or deleted from the law by amendment.



	2 HOUSE BILL 1101						
$     \begin{array}{c}       1 \\       2 \\       3 \\       4 \\       5     \end{array} $	<u>BY repealing</u> <u>Article – Environment</u> <u>Section 9–344.1</u> <u>Annotated Code of Maryland</u> (2014 Replacement Volume and 2023 Supplement)						
$6 \\ 7$	SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF MARYLAND, That the Laws of Maryland read as follows:						
8	Article – Environment						
9	SUBTITLE 9. CLEAN WATER JUSTICE ACT.						
10	1-901.						
$\frac{11}{12}$	(A) IN THIS SUBTITLE THE FOLLOWING WORDS HAVE THE MEANINGS INDICATED.						
$\begin{array}{c} 13\\14\\15\end{array}$	(B) "Association" means an association, a corporation, or any other organization that consists of two or more members joined by mutual consent for a common purpose.						
16 17 18	(C) (B) "COSTS OF LITIGATION" INCLUDES REASONABLE ATTORNEY'S FEES, COURT COSTS, <u>AND</u> EXPERT WITNESS FEES <del>, AND DOCUMENTED COSTS</del> INCURRED IN INVESTIGATING ALLEGED VIOLATIONS.						
19	(D) (1) "INJURY IN FACT" MEANS AN INVASION OF A LEGALLY						
20	PROTECTED INTEREST THAT IS:						
21	(I) CONCRETE AND PARTICULARIZED;						
22	(II) ACTUAL OR IMMINENT; AND						
23	(III) NOT CONJECTURAL OR HYPOTHETICAL.						
24	(2) "Injury in fact" includes:						
25	(I) A property right or personal interest that is						
<b>-</b> © 26	DISTINCT FROM, OR SPECIFICALLY AFFECTED IN A WAY THAT IS DISTINCT FROM, A						
27	PROPERTY RIGHT OR PERSONAL INTEREST OF THE GENERAL PUBLIC; AND						
28	(II) A NEGATIVE IMPACT, OR THE THREAT OF A NEGATIVE						
29	IMPACT, TO A PERSON'S HEALTH OR TO THE USE AND ENJOYMENT OF A NATURAL						
30	RESOURCE OR ENVIRONMENT, INCLUDING A NEGATIVE IMPACT TO AESTHETIC,						
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·						

1	RECREATION	<del>ONAL,</del>	CONSERVATIONAL, AND ECONOMIC INTERESTS THAT MAY BE				
2	SHARED AMONG COMMUNITY MEMBERS.						
3	<u>(C)</u>	<u>"Eph</u>	IEMERAL STREAM" MEANS A BODY OF WATER WITH:				
4		<u>(1)</u>	A STREAM BED LOCATED ABOVE THE WATER TABLE YEAR-ROUND;				
$5 \\ 6$	AND	<u>(2)</u>	A STREAM FLOW PRIMARILY SOURCED FROM RAINFALL RUNOFF;				
7 8		<u>(3)</u> ecipii	FLOWING WATER ONLY DURING, AND FOR A SHORT DURATION CATION EVENTS IN A TYPICAL YEAR.				
9	<u>(D)</u>	<u>"Int</u>	ERMITTENT STREAM" MEANS A BODY OF WATER WITH:				
$\begin{array}{c} 10\\ 11 \end{array}$	GROUNDW	<u>(1)</u> ATER 1	FLOWING WATER DURING CERTAIN TIMES OF THE YEAR, WHEN PROVIDES WATER FOR STREAM FLOW; AND				
12		<u>(2)</u>	A STREAM FLOW SUPPLEMENTED BY RUNOFF FROM RAINFALL.				
13	<b>(E)</b>	"Poi	LITICAL SUBDIVISION" MEANS:				
14		(1)	A COUNTY;				
15		(2)	THE CITY OF BALTIMORE;				
16		(3)	A MULTICOUNTY AGENCY;				
17		(4)	A MUNICIPAL CORPORATION;				
18		(5)	A SINGLE–PURPOSE DISTRICT; OR				
19		(6)	A <del>soil conservation or</del> sanitary district.				
$\begin{array}{c} 20\\ 21 \end{array}$	<del>(F)</del> Appointe		<del>'retary" means the secretary of any State agency,</del> <del>he Governor.</del>				
22	<del>(G)</del> (	F)	"STANDARD" MEANS ANY REQUIREMENT, PROHIBITION,				

LIMITATION, OR CONDITION ESTABLISHED BY STATUTE, REGULATION, PERMIT,
ORDER, OR LICENSE ISSUED BY A SECRETARY THE SECRETARY OR ANY OTHER
OFFICE OR AGENCY OF THE STATE, A LOCAL GOVERNMENT, OR A POLITICAL
SUBDIVISION IN ACCORDANCE WITH:

27 (1) TITLE 4, TITLE 5, <u>SUBTITLE 9 OF THIS ARTICLE, IF THE</u> 28 <u>REQUIREMENT, PROHIBITION, LIMITATION, OR CONDITION IS RELATED TO</u>

	4 HOUSE BILL 1101
1	NONTIDAL WETLANDS THAT DO NOT HAVE A CONTINUOUS SURFACE CONNECTION TO
2	
2	SURFACE WATER; OR
3	(2) TITLE 9, SUBTITLE 3 OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE, IF THE
4	REQUIREMENT, PROHIBITION, LIMITATION, OR CONDITION IS HYDROLOGICALLY
5	CONNECTED TO:
0	
6	(I) <u>AN EPHEMERAL STREAM; OR</u>
7	(II) <u>AN INTERMITTENT STREAM</u> .
8	1–902.
9	<del>(a) (1) Subject to paragraph (2) of</del> <u>Except as provided in</u> this
10	SUBSECTION SUBTITLE, A PERSON THAT MEETS THE THRESHOLD STANDING
11	REQUIREMENTS UNDER FEDERAL LAW HAS STANDING IN CIVIL CLAIMS ARISING
12	UNDER ANY STANDARD TITLE 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE OR
13	TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8, SUBTITLE 18 OF THE
14	NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE IF THE PERSON SUFFERS AN INJURY IN FACT THAT:
15	(I) IS FAIRLY TRACEABLE TO THE CHALLENGED ACTION OR
16	CONDUCT OF THE DEFENDANT; AND
17	(II) IS LIKELY TO BE REDRESSED BY THE REQUESTED RELIEF
18	OR A FAVORABLE JUDICIAL DECISION.
19	(2) AN INTEREST OR INJURY ASSERTED UNDER THIS SECTION SHALL
	FALL WITHIN THE ZONE OF INTERESTS SOUGHT TO BE PROTECTED BY TITLE 4,
21	TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE AND TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE
22	5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8, SUBTITLE 18 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE.
23	(B) IN ADDITION TO SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION, AN ASSOCIATION
$\overline{24}$	HAS STANDING IN CLAIMS ARISING UNDER TITLE 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16
25	OF THIS ARTICLE OR TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 5,
26	SUBTITLE 18 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE IF:
20	
27	(1) ONE OR MORE MEMBERS OF THE ASSOCIATION HAVE STANDING
28	UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION;
29	(2) THE INTERESTS THAT THE ASSOCIATION SEEKS TO PROTECT ARE
30	GERMANE TO ITS PURPOSES; AND
_	
31	(3) Neither the claim asserted nor the relief requested
32	<del>REQUIRES THE PARTICIPATION OF THE MEMBER</del> .

1 **1–903.** 

2 (A) SUBJECT TO SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS SECTION, A PERSON THAT HAS 3 STANDING UNDER § 1–902 OF THIS SUBTITLE MAY BRING A CIVIL ACTION ON THE 4 PERSON'S OWN BEHALF AGAINST ANY PERSON OR GOVERNMENTAL ENTITY THAT IS 5 ALLEGED TO HAVE VIOLATED OR TO BE IN VIOLATION OF ANY STANDARD.

6 (B) (1) SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (3) OF THIS SUBSECTION, AN ACTION
7 MAY <u>NOT</u> BE BROUGHT UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION AT LEAST 60 DAYS
8 AFTER THE PLAINTIFF HAS GIVEN UNLESS THE PLAINTIFF HAS FIRST BEEN GIVEN
9 60 DAYS NOTICE OF THE ALLEGED VIOLATION.

10	(2)	Not	ICE UN	NDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL BE:
11		<b>(I)</b>	1.	BY CERTIFIED MAIL; OR
12			2.	PERSONAL SERVICE; AND
13		(II)	PRO	VIDED TO:
14			1.	THE APPROPRIATE SECRETARY SECRETARY;
15			2.	THE ATTORNEY GENERAL;
16			3.	ANY LOCAL JURISDICTION IN WHICH THE ALLEGED
17	VIOLATION HAS	<del>)CCUI</del>	<del>RED</del> Ⅰ	<u>S ALLEGED TO OCCUR;</u> AND
18			4.	AN ALLEGED VIOLATOR OF THE STANDARD.
19	(3)	<b>(I)</b>	AN A	CTION MAY NOT BE BROUGHT UNDER SUBSECTION (A)
20		· · ·		SECRETARY HAS COMMENCED AND IS
21				CIVIL <del>OR CRIMINAL</del> ACTION <del>IN A COURT OF THE STATE</del>
22	OR A CONSENT O	RDER	IS EN'	TERED TO REQUIRE COMPLIANCE FROM THE ALLEGED
23	VIOLATOR WITH	HOUT	UND	UE DELAY OR UNREASONABLE SCHEDULES FOR
24	RETURNING TO (	<del>OMPI</del>	HANCH	2.
25		<b>(</b> II)		WITHSTANDING SUBPARAGRAPH (I) OF THIS
26	PARAGRAPH, A	PERSO	N THA	AT HAS STANDING UNDER § 1-902 OF THIS SUBTITLE
27	MEETS THE THE	RESHO	LD ST	ANDING REQUIREMENTS UNDER FEDERAL LAW MAY
28	INTERVENE IN A	FHE A	CIVIL	ACTION BROUGHT BY THE SECRETARY SECRETARY
00				

29 <u>UNDER:</u>

30

- <u>1.</u>
- <u>TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 9 OF THIS ARTICLE; OR</u>

	6 HOUSE BILL 1101				
1	2. <u>TITLE 9, SUBTITLE 3 OF THIS ARTICLE</u> .				
2	(4) NOTICE UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL IDENTIFY:				
3	(I) A STANDARD VIOLATED;				
4	(II) AN ACTIVITY CONSTITUTING THE VIOLATION;				
$5 \\ 6$	(III) A PERSON SUSPECTED OF BEING RESPONSIBLE FOR THE VIOLATION;				
7	(IV) THE LOCATION OF THE VIOLATION;				
8	(V) THE DATES OF VIOLATIONS IF KNOWN; AND				
9	(VI) THE NAME AND ADDRESS OF THE PERSON GIVING NOTICE.				
10 11 12 13	BROUGHT IN ANY CIRCUIT COURT OF A COUNTY WHERE THE <del>ALLEGED</del> CONDITION, ACTIVITY, OR FAILURE <del>IS OCCURRING, HAS OCCURRED, OR IS LIKELY TO OCCUR</del> <u>IS</u>				
14 15 16 17	(D) <u>BEFORE THE ENTERING OF ANY CONSENT JUDGMENT TO WHICH THE</u> DEPARTMENT IS NOT A PARTY OR BEFORE THE DISMISSAL OF ANY CASE FILED IN ACCORDANCE WITH THIS SUBTITLE SUBJECT TO A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, THE PLAINTIFF SHALL:				
18 19 20 21 22	(1) GIVE NOTICE AND PROVIDE A COMPLETE AND UNREDACTED COPY OF THE PROPOSED CONSENT JUDGMENT OR SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT TO THE DEPARTMENT AND THE ATTORNEY GENERAL BY PERSONAL SERVICE OR CERTIFIED MAIL AT LEAST 45 DAYS BEFORE THE DATE THAT THE PROPOSED CONSENT JUDGMENT OR SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT IS FILED WITH THE COURT; AND				
$\begin{array}{c} 23\\ 24\\ 25 \end{array}$	(2) FILE AN AFFIDAVIT WITH THE COURT UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY INDICATING COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT UNDER ITEM (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION.				
26 27 28	(E) A COURT MAY: (1) ORDER THE ENFORCEMENT OF A STANDARD CHALLENGED UNDER THIS SECTION;; AND				
29	(2) <b>GRANT</b> :				

1	(I) <b>TEMPORARY OR PERMANENT EQUITABLE RELIEF; OR</b>
2	(II) ANY EXCEPT AS OTHERWISE PROVIDED BY THIS SUBTITLE,
-3	ANY OTHER RELIEF PROVIDED UNDER A STATUTE CHALLENGED UNDER THIS
4	SECTION STANDARD; AND
-	
$5 \\ 6$	(3) IMPOSE CONDITIONS ON A DEFENDANT TO REQUIRE THE
6 7	PROTECTION OF LAND, AIR, WATER, AND OTHER NATURAL RESOURCES OR PUBLIC HEALTH FROM POLLUTION, IMPAIRMENT, OR DESTRUCTION.
1	HEADIN FROM FOLLO HON, IMPANNENT, OR DESTRUCTION.
8	(E) (1) (F) IN AN ACTION UNDER THIS SECTION, THE COURT MAY
9	AWARD THE COSTS OF LITIGATION TO:
10	(1) (1) A PREVAILING PLAINTIFF; OR
11	(II) (2) A SUBSTANTIALLY PREVAILING PLAINTIFF; OR
11	$\frac{117}{2}$ A SUBSTANTIALLY FREVAILING FLAINTIFF, OR
12	(3) A SUBSTANTIALLY PREVAILING DEFENDANT IF THE PLAINTIFF'S
13	CLAIM WAS FRIVOLOUS, UNREASONABLE, OR GROUNDLESS. HF THE-PLAINTIFF HAS;
14	1. PARTICIPATED IN AN ACTION TO ENFORCE A
15	<b>VIOLATION FOLLOWING THE ISSUANCE OF NOTICE UNDER SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS</b>
16	SECTION; AND
17	2. A. Successfully established the liability
18	OF A DEFENDANT IN FEWER THAN ALL OF THE ASSERTED CLAIMS; OR
10	
19	<b>B.</b> Otherwise advanced the purpose of the
20	RELEVANT STATUTES THROUGH THE OUTCOME OF THE ACTION BY IMPROVING
21	ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY, PROTECTING PUBLIC HEALTH, OR REDUCING
22	POLLUTION.
23	(2) IF A PARTY TO AN ACTION UNDER THIS SECTION ACTS IN BAD
$\frac{23}{24}$	FAITH OR WITHOUT SUBSTANTIAL JUSTIFICATION IN MAINTAINING OR DEFENDING
$\frac{24}{25}$	THE ACTION, THE COURT MAY AWARD TO THE ADVERSE PARTY THE COSTS OF
26 26	LITIGATION.
20	
27	(F) (G) (1) (I) A EXCEPT AS PROVIDED IN PARAGRAPH (3) OF THIS
28	SUBSECTION, A COURT MAY IMPOSE A CIVIL PENALTY AUTHORIZED IN ACCORDANCE
29	WITH THE STATUTE UNDER WHICH AN ACTION IS BROUGHT UNDER THIS SECTION.
<u>90</u>	(II) INCOMEND OF INDOGING A COULD DENALTRY UNDER
30 21	(II) INSTEAD OF IMPOSING A CIVIL PENALTY UNDER
31	SUBPARAGRAPH (I) OF THIS PARAGRAPH, A A COURT MAY ORDER APPROVE A

1CONSENT JUDGMENT OR SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE PARTIES THAT2INCLUDES A SUPPLEMENTAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROJECT.

3 (2) SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (3) OF THIS SUBSECTION, A A CIVIL
 4 PENALTY COLLECTED UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL BE DEPOSITED IN A MANNER
 5 SPECIFIED BY THE STATUTE.

6 (3) IF THE ENFORCEMENT OF A STATUTORY DUTY HAS BEEN 7 DELEGATED TO A LOCAL GOVERNMENT, UP TO 50% OF A CIVIL PENALTY COLLECTED 8 UNDER THIS SUBSECTION MAY BE AWARDED TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT THE 9 STATE MAY NOT BE HELD LIABLE FOR CIVIL PENALTIES IN ANY ACTION UNDER THIS 10 SUBTITLE.

11 **1–904.** 

12 (A) (<u>1</u>) THIS SECTION DOES NOT APPLY TO § 1-903(B)(3) OF THIS 13 SUBTITLE.

14 (B) A SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (2) OF THIS SUBSECTION, A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING UNDER § 1–902 OF THIS SUBTITLE MAY HAS THE UNCONDITIONAL 15RIGHT AND THE AUTHORITY TO INTERVENE AS A MATTER OF RIGHT IN AN A CIVIL 16 ACTION ARISING UNDER THE 4, THE 5, THE 9, OR THE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE 17OR TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8, SUBTITLE 18 OF THE 18 NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE, UNLESS A DEFENDANT DEMONSTRATES THAT THE 19 20 PERSON'S INTEREST IS-ADEQUATELY REPRESENTED BY EXISTING PARTIES ANY 21STANDARD.

22(2)A PERSON SHALL EXERCISE THE RIGHT TO INTERVENE UNDER23PARAGRAPH (1) OF THIS SUBSECTION IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE APPLICABLE24PRACTICES, PROCEDURES, AND LAWS IN THE STATE.

25 (3) <u>A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING TO INTERVENE UNDER § 1–902 OF</u>
 26 <u>THIS SUBTITLE HAS THE SAME RIGHTS AS AN INTERESTED PERSON OR AGGRIEVED</u>
 27 <u>PARTY UNDER THE FEDERAL CLEAN WATER ACT.</u>

28(C) (B)THE STATE MAY INTERVENE AS A MATTER OF RIGHT AT ANY TIME29IN & ANY PROCEEDING BROUGHT UNDER THIS SUBTITLE.

30 (D) NOTWITHSTANDING § 1–903(B)(3) OF THIS SUBTITLE AND SUBSECTION
 31 (A) OF THIS SECTION, A COURT MAY GRANT INTERVENTION ON MOTION BY ANY
 32 PARTY.

33 <del>1-905.</del>

1	THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SUBTITLE SUPERSEDE ANY INCONSISTENT
2	PROVISION OF ANY STATE, COUNTY, OR MUNICIPAL LAW, ORDINANCE, OR
3	REGULATION AND ANY JUDICIAL INTERPRETATION TO THE EXTENT OF THE
4	INCONSISTENCY.
5	<u>[9-344.1.</u>
6	(a) Subject to subsection (b) of this section, a person who meets the threshold
7	standing requirements under the federal Clean Water Act has an unconditional right and
8	the authority to intervene in a civil action that the State initiates in State court to require
9	<u>compliance with:</u>
10	(1) This subtitle;
11	(2) <u>Regulations adopted by the Department in accordance with this</u>
12	subtitle; or
13	(3) Any discharge permit, effluent limitation, or order issued by the
14	<u>Department in accordance with this subtitle.</u>
15	(b) A person shall exercise the right to intervene under subsection (a) of this
16	section in accordance with the applicable practices, procedures, and laws in the State.
17	(c) <u>A person who meets the requirements to intervene under subsection (a) of this</u>
18	section has the same rights as an interested person or aggrieved party under the federal
19	<u>Clean Water Act, including the right to apply for judicial appeal.</u>
90	CECTION 9 AND DE LE EUDEUED ENACEED That if any married of this Ast on
$\begin{array}{c} 20\\ 21 \end{array}$	SECTION 2. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That, if any provision of this Act or the application thereof to any person or circumstance is held invalid for any reason in a
$\frac{21}{22}$	court of competent jurisdiction, the invalidity does not affect other provisions or any other
$\frac{22}{23}$	application of this Act that can be given effect without the invalid provision or application,
$\overline{24}$	and for this purpose the provisions of this Act are declared severable.
25	SECTION 3. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That it is the intent of the General
26	Assembly that this Act:
07	(1) and it and in the sheet the sellection destruction of
$\frac{27}{28}$	(1) provide certain remedies to abate the pollution, destruction, or substantial or unreasonable impairment to the public health, water quality, or any other
$\frac{20}{29}$	natural resource of the State;
-0	
30	(2) may not abridge or alter any right of action or remedies that exist under
31	law; and
0.0	
32	(3) may not be construed as stopping or limiting the State or any person in
33	the exercise of the right to:

	10		HOUSE BILL 1101
1		(i)	protect the natural resources of the State;
2		(ii)	suppress nuisances; or
3		(iii)	abate pollution.
4	SECTIO	ON 4. AND	BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall take effect

Approved:

 $\mathbf{5}$ 

October 1, 2024.

Governor.

Speaker of the House of Delegates.

President of the Senate.