M3, M1 4lr1885 CF 4lr1884

By: Senator Augustine

Introduced and read first time: January 29, 2024 Assigned to: Education, Energy, and the Environment

A BILL ENTITLED

2

3

Standing – Environmental and Natural Resources Protection Proceedings (Clean Water Justice Act of 2024)

4 FOR the purpose of providing certain persons and associations standing in certain 5 environmental and natural resources protection proceedings, including proceedings 6 arising under provisions of law relating to water quality and water resources 7 protection, subject to certain conditions; authorizing certain persons that meet 8 certain standing requirements to bring certain civil actions under certain circumstances; authorizing a court to grant certain relief, award certain costs of 9 litigation, and impose certain civil penalties in certain civil actions under certain 10 11 circumstances; authorizing certain persons that meet certain standing requirements 12 to intervene in certain proceedings under certain circumstances; and generally 13 relating to standing in certain environmental and natural resources protection 14 proceedings.

- 15 BY adding to
- 16 Article Environment
- 17 Section 1–901 through 1–905 to be under the new subtitle "Subtitle 9. Clean Water
- 18 Justice Act"
- 19 Annotated Code of Maryland
- 20 (2013 Replacement Volume and 2023 Supplement)
- 21 SECTION 1. BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF MARYLAND,
- 22 That the Laws of Maryland read as follows:
- 23 Article Environment
- 24 SUBTITLE 9. CLEAN WATER JUSTICE ACT.
- 25 **1–901.**

(4)

27

1 2	(A) IN THIS SUBTITLE THE FOLLOWING WORDS HAVE THE MEANINGS INDICATED.			
3 4 5	(B) "ASSOCIATION" MEANS AN ASSOCIATION, A CORPORATION, OR ANY OTHER ORGANIZATION THAT CONSISTS OF TWO OR MORE MEMBERS JOINED BY MUTUAL CONSENT FOR A COMMON PURPOSE.			
	(C) "COSTS OF LITIGATION" INCLUDES REASONABLE ATTORNEY'S FEES COURT COSTS, EXPERT WITNESS FEES, AND DOCUMENTED COSTS INCURRED IN INVESTIGATING ALLEGED VIOLATIONS.			
9	(D) (1) "INJURY IN FACT" MEANS AN INVASION OF A LEGALLY PROTECTED INTEREST THAT IS:			
1	(I) CONCRETE AND PARTICULARIZED;			
12	(II) ACTUAL OR IMMINENT; AND			
13	(III) NOT CONJECTURAL OR HYPOTHETICAL.			
4	(2) "INJURY IN FACT" INCLUDES:			
15 16 17	(I) A PROPERTY RIGHT OR PERSONAL INTEREST THAT IS DISTINCT FROM, OR SPECIFICALLY AFFECTED IN A WAY THAT IS DISTINCT FROM, A PROPERTY RIGHT OR PERSONAL INTEREST OF THE GENERAL PUBLIC; AND			
18 19 20 21 22	(II) A NEGATIVE IMPACT, OR THE THREAT OF A NEGATIVE IMPACT, TO A PERSON'S HEALTH OR TO THE USE AND ENJOYMENT OF A NATURAL RESOURCE OR ENVIRONMENT, INCLUDING A NEGATIVE IMPACT TO AESTHETIC, RECREATIONAL, CONSERVATIONAL, AND ECONOMIC INTERESTS THAT MAY BE SHARED AMONG COMMUNITY MEMBERS.			
23	(E) "POLITICAL SUBDIVISION" MEANS:			
24	(1) A COUNTY;			
25	(2) THE CITY OF BALTIMORE;			
26	(3) A MULTICOUNTY AGENCY;			

A MUNICIPAL CORPORATION;

- 1 (5) A SINGLE-PURPOSE DISTRICT; OR
- 2 (6) A SOIL CONSERVATION OR SANITARY DISTRICT.
- 3 (F) "SECRETARY" MEANS THE SECRETARY OF ANY STATE AGENCY, 4 APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNOR.
- 5 (G) "STANDARD" MEANS ANY REQUIREMENT, PROHIBITION, LIMITATION,
- 6 OR CONDITION ESTABLISHED BY STATUTE, REGULATION, PERMIT, ORDER, OR
- 7 LICENSE ISSUED BY A SECRETARY OR ANY OTHER OFFICE OR AGENCY OF THE STATE,
- 8 A LOCAL GOVERNMENT, OR A POLITICAL SUBDIVISION IN ACCORDANCE WITH TITLE
- 9 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE.
- 10 **1–902.**
- 11 (A) (1) SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (2) OF THIS SUBSECTION, A PERSON HAS
- 12 STANDING IN CLAIMS ARISING UNDER TITLE 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF
- 13 THIS ARTICLE OR TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8,
- 14 SUBTITLE 18 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE IF THE PERSON SUFFERS AN
- 15 INJURY IN FACT THAT:
- 16 (I) IS FAIRLY TRACEABLE TO THE CHALLENGED ACTION OR
- 17 CONDUCT OF THE DEFENDANT; AND
- 18 (II) IS LIKELY TO BE REDRESSED BY THE REQUESTED RELIEF
- 19 OR A FAVORABLE JUDICIAL DECISION.
- 20 (2) AN INTEREST OR INJURY ASSERTED UNDER THIS SECTION SHALL
- 21 FALL WITHIN THE ZONE OF INTERESTS SOUGHT TO BE PROTECTED BY TITLE 4,
- 22 TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE AND TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE
- 23 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8, SUBTITLE 18 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE.
- 24 (B) IN ADDITION TO SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION, AN ASSOCIATION
- 25 HAS STANDING IN CLAIMS ARISING UNDER TITLE 4, TITLE 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16
- 26 OF THIS ARTICLE OR TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5, SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8,
- 27 SUBTITLE 18 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE IF:
- 28 (1) One or more members of the association have standing
- 29 UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION;
- 30 (2) THE INTERESTS THAT THE ASSOCIATION SEEKS TO PROTECT ARE
- 31 GERMANE TO ITS PURPOSES; AND

28

- (3) NEITHER THE CLAIM ASSERTED NOR THE RELIEF REQUESTED 1 2 REQUIRES THE PARTICIPATION OF THE MEMBER. 1-903. 3 SUBJECT TO SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS SECTION, A PERSON THAT HAS 4 STANDING UNDER § 1–902 OF THIS SUBTITLE MAY BRING A CIVIL ACTION ON THE 5 PERSON'S OWN BEHALF AGAINST ANY PERSON OR GOVERNMENTAL ENTITY THAT IS 7 ALLEGED TO HAVE VIOLATED OR TO BE IN VIOLATION OF ANY STANDARD. 8 (B) SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (3) OF THIS SUBSECTION, AN ACTION MAY BE BROUGHT UNDER SUBSECTION (A) OF THIS SECTION AT LEAST 60 DAYS 9 AFTER THE PLAINTIFF HAS GIVEN NOTICE OF THE ALLEGED VIOLATION. 10 11 **(2)** NOTICE UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL BE: 12 (I)1. BY CERTIFIED MAIL; OR 2. 13 PERSONAL SERVICE; AND 14 (II) PROVIDED TO: 1. THE APPROPRIATE SECRETARY; 15 16 2. THE ATTORNEY GENERAL; 17 3. ANY LOCAL JURISDICTION IN WHICH THE ALLEGED 18 **VIOLATION HAS OCCURRED; AND** 19 4. AN ALLEGED VIOLATOR OF THE STANDARD. 20 **(3) (I)** AN ACTION MAY NOT BE BROUGHT UNDER SUBSECTION (A) 21OF THIS SECTION IF THE SECRETARY HAS COMMENCED AND IS DILIGENTLY 22PROSECUTING A CIVIL OR CRIMINAL ACTION IN A COURT OF THE STATE TO REQUIRE COMPLIANCE FROM THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR WITHOUT UNDUE DELAY OR 23UNREASONABLE SCHEDULES FOR RETURNING TO COMPLIANCE. 2425 NOTWITHSTANDING SUBPARAGRAPH (I)(II) \mathbf{OF} THIS
- 26 PARAGRAPH, A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING UNDER § 1–902 OF THIS SUBTITLE MAY 27 INTERVENE IN THE ACTION BROUGHT BY THE SECRETARY.
 - (4) NOTICE UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL IDENTIFY:

1		(I)	A STANDARD VIOLATED;	
2	VIOLATION;	(II)	AN ACTIVITY CONSTITUTING THE VIOLATION;	
3 4		(III)	A PERSON SUSPECTED OF BEING RESPONSIBLE FOR THE	
5		(IV)	THE LOCATION OF THE VIOLATION;	
6		(v)	THE DATES OF VIOLATIONS IF KNOWN; AND	
7		(VI)	THE NAME AND ADDRESS OF THE PERSON GIVING NOTICE.	
8 9 10	(C) AN ACTION BROUGHT IN ACCORDANCE WITH THIS SECTION SHALL BE BROUGHT IN ANY CIRCUIT COURT OF A COUNTY WHERE THE ALLEGED CONDITION ACTIVITY, OR FAILURE IS OCCURRING, HAS OCCURRED, OR IS LIKELY TO OCCUR.			
11	(D) A CO	URT M	IAY:	
12 13	(1) ORDER THE ENFORCEMENT OF A STANDARD CHALLENGED UNDER THIS SECTION;			
14	(2)	GRA	NT:	
15		(I)	TEMPORARY OR PERMANENT EQUITABLE RELIEF; OR	
16 17	CHALLENGED UN	(II) DER T	ANY OTHER RELIEF PROVIDED UNDER A STATUTE THIS SECTION; AND	
18 19 20		LAND	OSE CONDITIONS ON A DEFENDANT TO REQUIRE THE AIR, WATER, AND OTHER NATURAL RESOURCES OR PUBLIC TION, IMPAIRMENT, OR DESTRUCTION.	
21 22	(E) (1) COSTS OF LITIGA		N ACTION UNDER THIS SECTION, THE COURT MAY AWARD THE FO:	
23		(I)	A PREVAILING PLAINTIFF; OR	
24 25	PLAINTIFF HAS:	(II)	A SUBSTANTIALLY PREVAILING PLAINTIFF IF THE	

- 1. PARTICIPATED IN AN ACTION TO ENFORCE A
- 2 VIOLATION FOLLOWING THE ISSUANCE OF NOTICE UNDER SUBSECTION (B) OF THIS
- 3 SECTION; AND
- 4 2. A. SUCCESSFULLY ESTABLISHED THE LIABILITY
- 5 OF A DEFENDANT IN FEWER THAN ALL OF THE ASSERTED CLAIMS; OR
- B. OTHERWISE ADVANCED THE PURPOSE OF THE
- 7 RELEVANT STATUTES THROUGH THE OUTCOME OF THE ACTION BY IMPROVING
- 8 ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY, PROTECTING PUBLIC HEALTH, OR REDUCING
- 9 POLLUTION.
- 10 (2) If A PARTY TO AN ACTION UNDER THIS SECTION ACTS IN BAD
- 11 FAITH OR WITHOUT SUBSTANTIAL JUSTIFICATION IN MAINTAINING OR DEFENDING
- 12 THE ACTION, THE COURT MAY AWARD TO THE ADVERSE PARTY THE COSTS OF
- 13 **LITIGATION.**
- 14 (F) (1) (I) A COURT MAY IMPOSE A CIVIL PENALTY AUTHORIZED IN
- 15 ACCORDANCE WITH THE STATUTE UNDER WHICH AN ACTION IS BROUGHT UNDER
- 16 THIS SECTION.
- 17 (II) INSTEAD OF IMPOSING A CIVIL PENALTY UNDER
- 18 SUBPARAGRAPH (I) OF THIS PARAGRAPH, A COURT MAY ORDER A SUPPLEMENTAL
- 19 ENVIRONMENTAL PROJECT.
- 20 (2) SUBJECT TO PARAGRAPH (3) OF THIS SUBSECTION, A CIVIL
- 21 PENALTY COLLECTED UNDER THIS SUBSECTION SHALL BE DEPOSITED IN A MANNER
- 22 SPECIFIED BY THE STATUTE.
- 23 (3) IF THE ENFORCEMENT OF A STATUTORY DUTY HAS BEEN
- 24 DELEGATED TO A LOCAL GOVERNMENT, UP TO 50% OF A CIVIL PENALTY COLLECTED
- 25 UNDER THIS SUBSECTION MAY BE AWARDED TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT.
- 26 **1-904.**
- 27 (A) THIS SECTION DOES NOT APPLY TO § 1–903(B)(3) OF THIS SUBTITLE.
- 28 (B) A PERSON THAT HAS STANDING UNDER § 1–902 OF THIS SUBTITLE MAY
- 29 INTERVENE AS A MATTER OF RIGHT IN AN ACTION ARISING UNDER TITLE 4, TITLE
- 30 5, TITLE 9, OR TITLE 16 OF THIS ARTICLE OR TITLE 1, SUBTITLE 3, TITLE 5,
- 31 SUBTITLE 16, OR TITLE 8, SUBTITLE 18 OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES ARTICLE,
- 32 UNLESS A DEFENDANT DEMONSTRATES THAT THE PERSON'S INTEREST IS
- 33 ADEQUATELY REPRESENTED BY EXISTING PARTIES.

- 1 (C) THE STATE MAY INTERVENE AS A MATTER OF RIGHT AT ANY TIME IN A PROCEEDING BROUGHT UNDER THIS SUBTITLE.
- 3 (D) NOTWITHSTANDING § 1–903(B)(3) OF THIS SUBTITLE AND SUBSECTION 4 (A) OF THIS SECTION, A COURT MAY GRANT INTERVENTION ON MOTION BY ANY 5 PARTY.
- 6 **1–905**.
- THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SUBTITLE SUPERSEDE ANY INCONSISTENT PROVISION OF ANY STATE, COUNTY, OR MUNICIPAL LAW, ORDINANCE, OR REGULATION AND ANY JUDICIAL INTERPRETATION TO THE EXTENT OF THE INCONSISTENCY.
- SECTION 2. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That, if any provision of this Act or the application thereof to any person or circumstance is held invalid for any reason in a court of competent jurisdiction, the invalidity does not affect other provisions or any other application of this Act that can be given effect without the invalid provision or application, and for this purpose the provisions of this Act are declared severable.
- SECTION 3. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That it is the intent of the General Assembly that this Act:
- 18 (1) provide certain remedies to abate the pollution, destruction, or 19 substantial or unreasonable impairment to the public health, water quality, or any other 20 natural resource of the State;
- 21 (2) may not abridge or alter any right of action or remedies that exist under 22 law; and
- 23 (3) may not be construed as stopping or limiting the State or any person in 24 the exercise of the right to:
- 25 (i) protect the natural resources of the State;
- 26 (ii) suppress nuisances; or
- 27 (iii) abate pollution.
- SECTION 4. AND BE IT FURTHER ENACTED, That this Act shall take effect October 1, 2024.