

Testimony on HB 671: Public Information Act – Personnel and Investigatory Records – Complaints Against Police Officers

UNFAVORABLE UNLESS AMENDED

Maryland Coalition for Justice and Police Accountability

February 9, 2021

Dear Honorable Chairman Clippinger, Vice Chair Atterbeary and Members of the House Judiciary Committee:

The Maryland Coalition for Justice and Police Accountability (MCJPA) is opposed to **HB 671: Public Information** Act – Personnel and Investigatory Records – Complaints Against Police Officers. MCJPA is a statewide coalition of over 90 organizations united to achieve meaningful police reform in Maryland - and includes individuals and family members who have been impacted by police violence, civil rights activists, religious leaders, legal experts, advocacy groups, and more.

Under current law, if you file a complaint of police misconduct, you cannot find out how the department investigates your complaint. You may only learn whether the complaint was sustained and what discipline if any was imposed. You cannot find out whether the department conducted a thorough or lackluster investigation of your complaint. You cannot find out why the department decided not to sustain the complaint, and you cannot find out why the department chose the discipline that it did. Furthermore, apart from complainants, the public at large, including the press, is unable to find out *anything* about police disciplinary investigations. When there is a critical incident, where an officer's conduct has raised public concerns, the public cannot learn anything about that officer's disciplinary history, and what the department previously knew about the officer, and what they did.

This is because Maryland's Public Information Act (MPIA) prohibits disclosure of disciplinary files. Disciplinary files are categorized as "personnel records" that are categorically prohibited from being disclosed under the MPIA. This bill amends the MPIA, but provides only very limited, and wholly inadequate, transparency of the critical public function of holding officers accountable for misconduct.

HB 671 allows discretionary disclosure over only the following disciplinary files:

- 1. Allegations, regardless of the outcome, regarding:
 - a. Discharge of a firearm at a person by an officer; and
 - b. Use of force resulting in death or serious bodily injury;
- 2. Only" administratively charged" allegations of:
 - a. Sexual assault against a member of the public;
 - b. Dishonesty, perjury, false statements, false reports, falsified or concealed evidence directly related to the reporting, investigation, or prosecution of a crime; and
 - c. Prohibited discrimination directly related to the reporting, investigation, or prosecution of a crime.

The disclosures that the bill would permit do not constitute meaningful transparency and accountability and are not consistent with the way the bill is being publicly described. HB 671 fails to require the disclosure of other serious incidents of misconduct, including discrimination, dishonesty, and improper use of force, where police officers are administratively charged." Instead, it expressly permits the custodian of record to deny access to those records for seven specifically listed reasons.

Talking points for the bill has described it as "require[ing] the disclosure of complaints against a police officer related to misconduct involving the discharge of a firearm or use of force that resulted in death or serious bodily injury." However, the bill does NOT require such disclosure, and expressly permits the custodian of record to deny access to those records for seven specifically listed reasons. Additionally, talking points for bill has described it as "require[ing] the disclosure of other serious incidents of misconduct, including discrimination, dishonesty, and improper use of force, where police officers are administratively charged." However, the bill does NOT require the disclosure of any of those records, and, as above, expressly permits the custodian of record to deny access to those records for seven specifically listed reasons.

Apart from whether disclosure is required, the categories and types of records that are permitted to be disclosed are far too limited. Apart from the discharge of a firearm, or use of force resulting in death or serious bodily injury, disclosure is limited to officers who have been "administratively charged." This means that for the limited category of other records that might be disclosed, there will be absolutely NO disclosure of records when the complaint is not sustained. That means that complainants will still never be able to learn *why* their complaint was not sustained, which is the outcome for roughly 90% of the complaints made by the public. They will still be told simply that they have to trust the integrity of the investigation and outcome. But that is precisely why there is no trust in the outcome, and why the law must be changed.

The bill does not include any use of force complaints where the victim doesn't die or suffer serious bodily injury unless the officer is administratively charged. Thus, there would be potentially no disclosure at all regarding uses of force where officers improperly point a firearm or even use a firearm when the injuries are not sufficiently serious. It also would not include improper use of a taser, or baton, or beating a suspect with a flashlight, or using a chokehold in violation of departmental policies, if the victim doesn't die and if the officer is not administratively charged. There would also be no disclosure of claims of most illegal searches, including illegal strip searches. There would be no disclosure of most improper or illegal stops or arrests, including improper stop and frisks. The list goes on and on.

Similarly, the public and press will never be able to learn about those investigations. We need disclosure of records of police investigations into alleged police misconduct, regardless of the outcome, because the problems with accountability that currently exist relate to too few officers being held accountable for misconduct, that is where the charges are not sustained, not with too many officers being held accountable.

We urge the committee to expand the range of misconduct that our communities have transparency over to include ALL categories of misconduct. Most importantly, our communities deserve transparency regardless of the outcome and particularly when complaints are unsustained because police departments often conduct slow, weak, or biased investigations (or no investigation at all!) and thereby allow officers to escape accountability for wrongdoing. Suppose there are problems with police internal investigations, and we believe that there is ample evidence that there are. In that case, they exist with respect to the cases where police are not being held accountable, and that is where transparency is needed.

Unless the bill is expanded, its passage will create the illusion of transparency without actual reform. Therefore, the Maryland Coalition for Justice and Police Accountability respectfully urges an unfavorable report on HB 671.

Respectfully,
Maryland Coalition for Justice and Police Accountability
*See the full list of coalition membership attached.

Advocates for Children and Youth

ACLU of Maryland

ACLU of Maryland, Montgomery County Chapter

Amnesty International

Arts Education in Maryland Schools Alliance (AEMS)

Baltimore Action Legal Team

Baltimore Bern Unit

Baltimore City Civilian Review Board

Baltimore City Democratic Socialists of America

Baltimore for Border Justice

Be More Unified

Council on American-Islamic Relations (CAIR) Office in Maryland

Central Atlantic Conference of the United Church of Christ

CASA

Caucus of African-Americans Leaders

Citizens Policing Project

Coalition for Justice for Anton Black

Coalition of Concerned Mothers

Coalition of People Opposed Violence and Extremism

Common Cause Maryland

Community Actively Seeking (C.A.S.T.)

Community Justice

Disability Rights Maryland

Do the Most Good

Drug Policy Alliance

Equity Matters

For Kathy's Sake

FreeState Justice

Greater Baltimore Democratic Socialists of America - Steering Committee

Greenbelt People Power

Hispanic National Law Enforcement Association

Homeless Persons Representation Project

Innocence Project

InterFaith Action for Human Rights

Jews United For Justice

Job Opportunities Task Force

Justice for Tyrone West Coalition

Justice Policy Institute

Kevin L. Cooper Foundation

Law Enforcement Action Partnership

Leaders of a Beautiful Struggle

League of Women Voters of Maryland

LGBTQ Dignity Project

Life After Release

Making Changes

Mama Sisterhood of Prince George's County

March for Our Lives Maryland

Maryland Alliance for Justice Reform

Maryland Center on Economic Policy

Maryland Consumer Rights Coalition

Maryland Defenders Union

Maryland Justice Project

Maryland Office of the Public Defender

Maryland Poor People's Campaign

Maryland Prisoners' Rights Coalition

Maryland Restorative Justice Initiative

Maryland State Conference of NAACP Branches

Marylanders to Prevent Gun Violence

Moms Demand Action

Montgomery County Civil Rights Coalition

Montgomery County Democratic Socialists of America

Mothers on the Move

NARAL Pro-Choice Maryland

National Coalition for Drug Legalization

Nigerian American Lawyers Association - Washington DC Chapter

Organizing Black

Our Maryland

Our Prince George's

Our Revolution Maryland

Out For Justice

Planned Parenthood of Maryland

Power Inside

Prevent Gun Violence Ministry, River Road Unitarian Universalist Congregation

Prince George's County Branch of Democratic Socialists of America

Prince George's People's Coalition

Prisons to Professionals

Progressive Maryland

Public Justice Center

Racial Justice NOW!

Rebuild, Overcome, and Rise (ROAR) Center at UMB

Reproductive Justice Inside

Sanctuary DMV

SEIU 1199

Showing up for Racial Justice Annapolis and Anne Arundel County (SURJ3A)

Showing Up for Racial Justice, Baltimore

Showing Up for Racial Justice, Montgomery County

Sierra Club Maryland Chapter

Silver Spring Justice Coalition

Takoma Park Mobilization

The JustUs Initiative

Wicomico County NAACP Branch 7028

Women's Law Center

Young People for Progress