

SENATE FINANCE COMMITTEE

Senate Bill 118

State Personnel — Collective Bargaining
January 27, 2022
Urging an Unfavorable Report

Chair Kelley, Vice Chair Feldman, and Members of the Committee:

Thank you for allowing us to testify on Senate Bill 118, which would authorize graduate assistants (GAs) to collectively bargain.

Graduate assistants are students, first and foremost. Nearly all Ph.D. students are GAs, and their duties as graduate teaching and research assistants are part of their education. Many doctoral programs expect or require all students to teach as part of their education, not only to prepare them as future faculty, but to gain experience explaining complex subjects and to understand the subject more deeply by learning to explain it to others. Research assistantships allow students to learn to do original research and scholarship under the guidance of a faculty mentor—research that is often identical to the dissertation research that is required for their degree.

The university's "Meet and Confer" process—where an elected group of GAs meets with the Provost, the Vice President for Finance and Administration, and the Dean of the Graduate School at least once each semester to discuss concerns and solutions—has been a productive avenue to address student concerns and solutions for the past ten years.

In response to concerns about stipend levels, the minimum stipend has increased 37% since July 2018. The minimum stipend of \$21,000 is above the cost of attendance, and the average stipend of \$23,000 for a 20 hours per week GA appointment during the 9-month academic year is equivalent to \$61,000 per year for full-time work. In addition to stipends, GAs receive free tuition and subsidized health insurance, bringing average GA compensation to about \$52,000 per year. Our minimum stipend is third among Big Ten publics, and only Rutgers has a higher average stipend.

Positive "Meet and Confer" outcomes include new policies for parental leave, time away from duties, and a grievance process. A Counselor position was created two years ago to help students access university services and support. Expectation-setting meetings between GAs and their supervisors are now required, and statements of mutual expectation developed to guide

them. In response to concerns that GAs were working more than 20 hours per week, we commissioned an independent study which showed GAs spend an average of 18 hours per week on their duties—including 6 hours that contribute to a student's own research required for the degree.

The "Meet and Confer" process provides GAs with many of the benefits that collective bargaining offers, including the right to engage a labor organization to assist them in this process. In the 12 years that the "Meet and Confer" process has been in place, GAs have declined to engage a labor organization.

In addition to the "Meet and Confer" process, graduate students serve on the Graduate Council, which sets policy for graduate education, including graduate assistantships. We also meet regularly with leadership of the Graduate Student Government.

The Graduate School encourages students to report violations of Graduate School and University policy, including excessive hours, harassment, unacceptable behavior, or unsafe conditions. The Graduate Student Ombudsman provides confidential and informal assistance in resolving conflicts and promotes fair and equitable treatment. The Graduate School can take formal action to investigate and resolve problems as needed. Collective bargaining would limit the University's ability to address graduate student problems as they arise and reduce the current flexibility to tailor solutions to the situation of a particular student.

The financial impact of collective bargaining would depend on the details of whatever contract is negotiated, but it could be substantial. Advocates of collective bargaining have argued for stipend levels of more than \$36,000 per year. Raising stipends to that level would cause a 70 percent increase in GA expenditures and a \$60 million per year increase in instructional expenditure, requiring more than a 10 percent increase in State appropriation or a 10 percent increase in tuition. If State appropriations and tuition did not rise to cover this increase, the result would be a 40 percent decrease in the number of GA appointments—and a corresponding decrease in the size of doctoral programs, the production of PhDs, and the contribution of our PhD programs to the Maryland knowledge economy.

In addition to increased stipends, collective bargaining could lead to changes in benefits. GAs already have access to the same health plans as faculty and staff. Their student status exempts them from Social Security and Medicare tax, but adding additional benefits could result in GAs being reclassified as "professional employees," subject to additional taxes. The University may need to withhold 7.65% from a GA's taxable compensation and pay an equal employer's share. Unemployment insurance and union dues are an additional cost. Expenditures for a GA could increase by more than 17% with no increase in student take-home pay. Moreover, students whose duties are not related to teaching or research could be excluded from GA appointments, or much of their tuition benefit could be subject to income tax.

Research assistantships, which are included in SB 118, are particularly difficult to adapt to collective bargaining. There often is a large overlap between the research a student does as a

research assistant, and the research a student does for their dissertation and degree. The former is essential training for the latter, and it is often impossible to determine where one ends and the other begins. Completing a dissertation—a piece of original research and scholarship—requires long hours of effort regardless of whether the student has a research assistantship, and the amount of effort required for the degree cannot be affected by collective bargaining. For this reason, most institutions that have collective bargaining for teaching assistants do not extend it to research assistants. Of the five Big Ten institutions with collective bargaining for GAs, only Rutgers includes research assistants, and the contract specifies that it has no impact on the research work needed to satisfy degree requirements.

Finally, collective bargaining takes a long time and stable relationships. This is difficult when the union representation is inexperienced and turns over every few years as students graduate. If collective bargaining is permitted, students who support union membership will leave campus soon after any election is held. A union will already be in place, and students who come after will have no say in whether it should exist. This is very different from the situation with faculty and staff, who remain as university employees for many years.

We are advocates for all graduate students, including GAs. We want all graduate students to succeed and to help resolve any problems that arise. Collective bargaining is not a path to this outcome that is in the best interests of UMD graduate students or the University.

Jennifer King Rice

Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs and Provost University of Maryland, College Park.

Steve Fetter

Associate Provost and Dean, The Graduate School University of Maryland, College Park

Minimum Graduate Assistant Stipends and Collective Bargaining Status

Big Ten Public Universities, Spring 2022, 20 hour/week appointment

	Minimum Stipend		Collective Bargaining?		
Institution	Academic Year	Full Year	TA	AA	RA
Rutgers ¹	30,162	33,999	Υ	Υ	Υ
Michigan	23,916		Υ	Υ	
Maryland ²	22,167	28,000			
Penn State	21,375	28,497			
Ohio State	21,280	28,373			
Wisconsin	20,500	24,816			
Iowa	20,302	24,804	Υ	Υ	
Illinois	19,300	25,733	Υ	Υ	
Michigan St ³	17,862	23,816	Υ		
Purdue	15,912	19,094			
Minnesota	15,573	20,764			
Indiana	15,000	18,000			
Nebraska	10,610	14,147			

¹Standard appointment is 15 hours per week.

Average Cost of Attendance and Average Stipend, AY21-22 (9 months)

Cost	Graduate Student	Graduate Assistant
Tuition (10 credits/semester)	\$34,120	_
Mandatory fees	\$1,635	\$1,635
Off-campus rent, utilities, food	\$14,586	\$14,586
Personal expenses	\$1,144	\$1,144
Books and supplies	\$1,000	\$1,000
Heath insurance	\$1,694	\$572
Transportation	\$3,278	\$3,278
Average cost of attendance	\$57,457	\$22,215
Average academic-year stipend	_	\$23,224

Tuition is the maximum covered for graduate assistants at the non-resident rate. Health insurance is the employee portion of the lowest-cost State plan for GAs and the student health insurance plan for other students. Other costs are estimated by the Office of Student Financial Aid according to federal guidelines; see https://financialaid.umd.edu/resources-policies/cost-attendance.

²For 9.5-month appointments. All TAs and 70% of all academic-year GA appointments are 9.5-month appointments. The minimum stipend for 9-month appointments is \$21,000.

³For TAs. The minimum academic-year stipend for non-union AAs and RAs is \$15,561.