



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

## Autoimmunity Reviews

journal homepage: [www.elsevier.com/locate/autrev](http://www.elsevier.com/locate/autrev)

## Review

## On the relationship between human papilloma virus vaccine and autoimmune diseases

Paolo Pellegrino<sup>a</sup>, Carla Carnovale<sup>a</sup>, Marco Pozzi<sup>b</sup>, Stefania Antoniazzi<sup>c</sup>, Valentina Perrone<sup>a</sup>, Dionigi Salvati<sup>a</sup>, Marta Gentili<sup>a</sup>, Tatiana Brusadelli<sup>a</sup>, Emilio Clementi<sup>b,d,1</sup>, Sonia Radice<sup>a</sup><sup>a</sup> Unit of Clinical Pharmacology, Department of Biomedical and Clinical Sciences, University Hospital "Luigi Sacco", Università di Milano, 20157 Milan, Italy<sup>b</sup> Scientific Institute, IRCCS E. Medea, 23842 Bosisio Parini, Lecco, Italy<sup>c</sup> IRCCS Foundation Ca' Granda Ospedale Maggiore Policlinico, Milan 20122, Italy<sup>d</sup> Unit of Clinical Pharmacology, Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche Institute of Neuroscience, Department of Biomedical and Clinical Sciences, University Hospital "Luigi Sacco", Università di Milano, 20157 Milan, Italy

## ARTICLE INFO

## Article history:

Received 1 January 2014

Accepted 14 January 2014

Available online xxx

## Keywords:

Human papilloma virus vaccine

Autoimmunity diseases

Multiple sclerosis

Acute disseminated encephalomyelitis

Rheumatoid arthritis

Juvenile idiopathic arthritis

## ABSTRACT

The human papilloma virus (HPV) vaccines were introduced to reduce the incidence of cervical cancer. The bivalent vaccine is effective against HPV-16, -18, -31, -33 and -45 while the quadrivalent vaccine is effective against HPV-16, 18, 31, 6 and 11 types. The immunisation, recommended for adolescent females, has led to high vaccine coverage in many countries.

Along with the introduction of the HPV vaccines, several cases of onset or exacerbations of autoimmune diseases following the vaccine shot have been reported in the literature and pharmacovigilance databases, triggering concerns about its safety. This vaccination programme, however, has been introduced in a population that is at high risk for the onset of autoimmune diseases, making it difficult to assess the role of HPV vaccine in these cases and no conclusive studies have been reported thus far.

We have thus analysed and reviewed comprehensively all case reports and studies dealing with either the onset of an autoimmune disease in vaccinated subject or the safety in patients with autoimmune diseases to define the role of the HPV vaccines in these diseases and hence its safety. A solid evidence of causal relationship was provided in few cases in the examined studies, and the risk vs. benefit of vaccination is still to be solved. The on-going vigilance for the safety of this vaccine remains thus of paramount importance.

© 2014 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

## Contents

|    |   |   |
|----|---|---|
| 37 | 1. Introduction   | 0 |
| 38 | 2. Autoimmune diseases  | 0 |
| 39 | 2.1. Method of analysis   | 0 |
| 40 | 2.2. Acute disseminated encephalomyelitis (ADEM) and other demyelinating diseases of the central nervous system | 0 |
| 41 | 2.3. Multiple sclerosis (MS)  | 0 |
| 42 | 2.4. Guillain-Barré syndrome (GBS)  | 0 |
| 43 | 2.5. Systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE)   | 0 |
| 44 | 2.6. Rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and juvenile idiopathic arthritis (JIA)  | 0 |
| 45 | 2.7. Inflammatory bowel disease (IBD)   | 0 |
| 46 | 2.8. Primary ovarian failure (POF)  | 0 |
| 47 | 2.9. Other autoimmune diseases  | 0 |
| 48 | 3. Discussion   | 0 |
| 49 | Abbreviations   | 0 |
| 50 | Take-home messages  | 0 |

E-mail address: [emilio.clementi@unimi.it](mailto:emilio.clementi@unimi.it) (E. Clementi).<sup>1</sup> Unit of Clinical Pharmacology, Department of Biomedical and Clinical Sciences, University Hospital "Luigi Sacco", University of Milan, Via GB Grassi 74, - 20157, Milano, Italy. Tel.: +39 0250319683; fax: +39 0250319682.

1568-9972/\$ – see front matter © 2014 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.autrev.2014.01.054>Please cite this article as: Pellegrino P, et al, On the relationship between human papilloma virus vaccine and autoimmune diseases, Autoimmun Rev (2014), <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.autrev.2014.01.054>

|    |                  |   |
|----|------------------|---|
| 51 | Acknowledgements | 0 |
| 52 | References       | 0 |

53

54 **1. Introduction**

55 The infection by specific oncogenic serotypes of human papilloma  
 56 virus (HPV) represents a key step in the pathogenesis of cervical cancers  
 57 as well as ano-genital and some other non-genital malignancies [1–5].  
 58 These diseases have a high impact on public health, with cervical cancer  
 59 representing the fourth most common cause of cancer-related death  
 60 worldwide, although the vast majority of these deaths (88%) occurs in  
 61 developing countries.

62 The high burden of this disease in developing countries is caused  
 63 mainly by the lack of screening and treatment facilities as well as suboptimal  
 64 nutrition and hygiene [6]. As the evolution from infection to invasive  
 65 cancer is slow, countries with screening programmes witness a  
 66 reduced incidence of cervical cancer from a rate of 50–80/100,000 observed  
 67 in unscreened women to a rate of 4–8/100,000 [1,3].

68 According to the Finland cancer registry, cervical cancer has declined  
 69 of about 75% over the past 60 years, primarily because at least 70% of the  
 70 population participates into a continuous Pap screening programme [2].  
 71 The importance of cervical cancer screening is remarkable, as when  
 72 20–29 year old unvaccinated women stopped attending Pap screening,  
 73 a four-fold increase in cervical cancer occurred within five years from  
 74 screening cessation [2,7,8].

75 Along with pap screening two vaccines were developed to protect  
 76 against the infection of the two serotypes most commonly related to  
 77 cervical cancer [1–3,9,10]. These vaccines have different formulation  
 78 as the bivalent vaccine contains 20 µg each of HPV 16 and HPV 18 L1  
 79 proteins, while the quadrivalent vaccine contains 40 µg of HPV 16,  
 80 20 µg of HPV 18, 20 µg of HPV 6 and 40 µg of HPV 11 [9,11]. The protection  
 81 of quadrivalent vaccine against HPV 6 and 11 is meant to prevent  
 82 the occurrence of genital warts, a minor issue in patients without HIV,  
 83 and respiratory papillomatosis [9].

84 The protection offered by these two vaccines extends to persistent  
 85 HPV 31 infection, while only the bivalent vaccine could prevent persistent  
 86 infections also from HPV 45 and 33 types [1,3,7].

87 Considerations on the clinical efficacy of these vaccines should take  
 88 into account several important “real-world” factors including: efficacy  
 89 against oncogenic HPV strains not covered by the vaccine and possibility  
 90 of increased frequency of infections with these types; efficacy in women  
 91 acquiring multiple HPV types; and effects in women with pre-existing  
 92 HPV infections [12]. Although the results from clinical trials showed  
 93 >97% HPV vaccine efficacy against HPV-16 and 18 related CIN-2/3 pre-  
 94 cancerous lesions, the corresponding figures against CIN-2/3 lesions  
 95 caused by all high-risk HPV types associated with cervical cancer were  
 96 only 16.9% in the per-protocol population. Thus, most likely, the true  
 97 HPV vaccine efficacy lies somewhere between 16.9% and 70% [13].

98 A recent analysis found an increased cervical cancer incidence when  
 99 vaccination was not accompanied by appropriate screening programmes  
 100 [1,7,8], and that combining screening with vaccination does not significantly  
 101 lower the incidence, while decreasing the number of women with  
 102 abnormal screening tests [1].

103 In this view, it is important to better define the safety profile of HPV  
 104 vaccines, especially considering their possible role as triggers of autoimmune  
 105 diseases. Such definition is of paramount importance, as would  
 106 allow physicians to provide a full and open discussion guiding women  
 107 to make a decision for their cervical cancer protection [1]. In addition  
 108 the introduction of a new vaccine in a population always raises concerns  
 109 in terms of safety [14,15]. As expected based on previous experience  
 110 with the introduction of other vaccines in a large cohorts of adolescent,  
 111 several cases of adverse drug reactions have been reported also for the  
 112 HPV vaccines, some of which being autoimmune diseases [16].

113 Numerous reports have thus raised the possibility of a causal  
 114 relationship between vaccination and autoimmune diseases and  
 115 hence on vaccine safety, without however providing a conclusive  
 116 answer [15–19].

117 In this view, we have reviewed all available information on HPV vac-  
 118 cine safety in patients with autoimmune diseases and about the risk for  
 119 healthy subjects to develop an autoimmune disease after vaccination;  
 120 we provide an updated indication about the possible side effect of  
 121 these vaccines.

122 **2. Autoimmune diseases**123 *2.1. Method of analysis*

124 We carried out a PubMed search up to 2013 using the terms: “Auto-  
 125 immune disease” OR “Multiple sclerosis” OR “Systemic lupus erythema-  
 126 tosus” OR “Guillain–Barré syndrome” OR “Acute disseminated  
 127 encephalomyelitis” OR “Demyelinating diseases” OR “Rheumatoid ar-  
 128 thritis” OR “Juvenile idiopathic arthritis” OR “Inflammatory bowel dis-  
 129 ease” OR “Primary ovarian failure” AND HPV vaccine. We considered  
 130 studies that included case reports and series, case–control studies,  
 131 post-marketing surveillance programmes and published analyses by  
 132 the Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting System (VAERS), a US-based na-  
 133 tional vaccine safety surveillance programme. We carried out an initial  
 134 screening by reading each abstract to identify the articles meeting  
 135 these inclusion criteria, which were conclusively assessed after a thor-  
 136 ough analysis of their content. The retrieved studies were then entirely  
 137 read to assess appropriateness. Citations from each included articles  
 138 were examined in order to identify any other published study potential-  
 139 ly meeting inclusion criteria. We limited the research to article written  
 140 in English.

141 *2.2. Acute disseminated encephalomyelitis (ADEM) and other demyelinat-  
 142 ing diseases of the central nervous system*

143 Acute disseminated encephalomyelitis is classically described as a  
 144 monophasic demyelinating disease of the central nervous system that  
 145 typically follows an infection or, with a lower frequency, a vaccination.  
 146 As highlighted in Table 1 numerous cases have been reported in the lit-  
 147 erature [20–24].

148 In most of the patients described in these reports, the pathology  
 149 onset occurred within few days after the second or third vaccine shot  
 150 [20–24]. The therapy response was generally good in all cases and no fa-  
 151 talities due to this condition were described [20–24].

152 ADEM following vaccination is a clinical entity poorly described in  
 153 terms of epidemiological features [25]. Based on the reports to the  
 154 VAERS and the European adverse event database, we recently showed  
 155 that HPV vaccine is amongst the ones most commonly related to  
 156 ADEM reports [25].

157 The incidence of ADEM following immunisation with the HPV  
 158 vaccine is unknown, but the reporting rate was estimated to be  
 159  $0.26/10^6$  (CI 95%:  $0.16/10^6$ – $0.37/10^6$ ) [23]. Such estimation was  
 160 achieved considering the reports to the VAERS database and the  
 161 doses of vaccine distributed in the same period [23].

162 Along with ADEM, other diseases characterised by demyelination of  
 163 the central nervous systems have been reported. In a recent case series,  
 164 Menge et al. reported on four cases of Neuromyelitis optica having  
 165 occurred after the administration of HPV vaccine [26]. This disease is  
 166 rarely observed in adolescent, but the observed cases may reflect the  
 167 natural disease prevalence considering the large population exposed

## Q2 Table 1

t1.1 Cases of autoimmune disease following HPV vaccination.

| t1.1 | Ref  | Authors            | Vaccine      | Condition                          | Age (years) |
|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------------------------------------|-------------|
| t1.1 | [20] | Shaffer et al.     | Bivalent     | ADEM                               | 15          |
| t1.1 | [21] | Wildeman et al.    | Quadrivalent | ADEM                               | 20          |
| t1.1 | [22] | Mendoza et al.     | Quadrivalent | ADEM                               | 15          |
| t1.1 | [23] | Pellegrino et al.  | Quadrivalent | ADEM                               | 13          |
| t1.1 | [23] |                    | Unknown      | ADEM                               | 12          |
| t1.1 | [24] | Dimario et al.     | Quadrivalent | ADEM                               | 16          |
| t1.1 | [26] | Menge et al.       | Quadrivalent | NMO                                | 17          |
| t1.1 | [26] |                    | Quadrivalent | NMO                                | 14          |
| t1.1 | [26] |                    | Quadrivalent | NMO                                | 13          |
| t1.1 | [26] |                    | Quadrivalent | NMO                                | 18          |
| t1.1 | [31] | Sutton et al.      | Quadrivalent | CIS                                | 21          |
| t1.1 | [31] |                    | Quadrivalent | CIS                                | 16          |
| t1.1 | [31] |                    | Quadrivalent | CDMS                               | 25          |
| t1.1 | [31] |                    | Quadrivalent | CDMS                               | 21          |
| t1.1 | [31] |                    | Quadrivalent | CDMS                               | 26          |
| t1.1 | [32] | Change et al.      | Quadrivalent | CIS                                | 19          |
| t1.1 | [32] |                    | Quadrivalent | CIS                                | 18          |
| t1.1 | [40] | Gatto et al.       | Quadrivalent | SLE                                | 32          |
| t1.1 | [40] |                    | Quadrivalent | SLE                                | 29          |
| t1.1 | [40] |                    | Quadrivalent | SLE-like                           | 16          |
| t1.1 | [40] |                    | Quadrivalent | antiphospholipid antibody syndrome | 16          |
| t1.1 | [40] |                    | Quadrivalent | SLE                                | 19          |
| t1.1 | [40] |                    | Quadrivalent | SLE                                | 13          |
| t1.1 | [41] | Soldevilla et al.  | Unknown      | SLE                                | 17          |
| t1.1 | [41] |                    | Unknown      | SLE                                | 45          |
| t1.1 | [41] |                    | Unknown      | SLE                                | 58          |
| t1.1 | [53] | Colafrancesco      | Quadrivalent | POF                                | 14          |
| t1.1 | [53] | et al.             | Quadrivalent | POF                                | 13          |
| t1.1 | [53] |                    | Quadrivalent | POF                                | 31          |
| t1.1 | [54] | Little et al.      | Quadrivalent | POF                                | 16          |
| t1.1 | [55] | Cerami et al.      | Quadrivalent | Autoimmune neuromyotonia           | 32          |
| t1.1 | [56] | Della Corte et al. | Bivalent     | Autoimmune hepatitis type 2        | 11          |
| t1.1 | [58] | Melo Gomes et al.  | Unknown      | HSP                                | 15          |
| t1.1 | [58] |                    | Unknown      | Cutaneous vasculitis               | 13          |
| t1.1 | [59] | Watanabe et al.    | Unknown      | Kikuchi–Fujimoto disease           | 14          |
| t1.1 | [60] | Yonee et al.       | Bivalent     | Acute cerebellar ataxia            | 12          |
| t1.1 | [61] | Katoulis et al.    | Quadrivalent | Erythema multiforme                | 19          |
| t1.1 | [62] | Pugnet et al.      | Quadrivalent | Immune thrombocytopenic purpura    | 16          |

t1.1 ADEM: acute disseminated encephalomyelitis; NMO: neuromyelitis optica; CIS: clinical isolated syndrome; CDMS: clinical defined multiple sclerosis; SLE: systemic lupus erythematosus; POF: primary ovarian failure.

168 to the vaccine [27,28]. It is therefore possible that these cases are simply  
169 close in time with the HPV vaccination rather than result from it [28].

## 170 2.3. Multiple sclerosis (MS)

171 The possible relationship between Multiple Sclerosis (MS) and vac-  
172 cination in adolescent was described in the early 1990 following the  
173 large scale implementation of the immunisation programme with the  
174 Hepatitis B vaccine (HBV) [29]. The results of further studies failed to  
175 demonstrate a significant association between the HBV vaccine and  
176 MS, but the concerns about this possible association resulted in a mas-  
177 sive loss of public confidence for this vaccine and in a low level of vac-  
178 cination coverage [30]. Along with the introduction of the HPV vaccine,  
179 the onset or exacerbation of MS has been reported in some patients  
180 within few days from the vaccine shot [31,32]. Despite the coincidence  
181 in time between vaccine shot and disease onset, it is unclear whether  
182 the vaccination had a role in the onset of the disease. The reporting  
183 rate of MS following HPV vaccination, estimated as previously described  
184 for ADEM, was 0.08/100,000 doses in the United States and 0.14/100,000  
185 doses in Australia. This reporting rate should be read considering the  
186 incidence of MS in the population exposed to the HPV vaccine [33], esti-  
187 mated to be one case per 100,000 subject every 6 weeks [15]. Such  
188 disproportion between the reporting rate and the incidence may indicate  
189 an absence of correlation between HPV vaccine and MS [15,33]. The pos-  
190 sibility of a time coincidence between vaccine and disease onset is  
191 sustained by the relative high incidence of MS in the subject who re-  
192 ceived the HPV vaccine [33].

## 2.4. Guillain–Barré syndrome (GBS)

193

The possible risk of Guillain–Barré syndrome (GBS), an acute inflam- 194  
matory demyelinating polyneuropathy, is a potential concern for large- 195  
scale vaccination programmes such as those against influenza or HPV 196  
[34,35]. A recent analysis of the VAERS database did not suggest an in- 197  
creased frequency of GBS onset following HPV4 vaccinations [36]. In- 198  
deed, considering the number of doses distributed from 1th June 2006 199  
to 31th December 2008, the reporting rate (i.e. number of GBS case/ 200  
dose distributed in the US) for GBS was 0.3 per 100,000 doses. This 201  
reporting rate should be compared with the background incidence of 202  
GBS in females aged 9–26 years, which was estimated to be of 1.57 203  
cases per 100,000 subjects [36]. The proportional reporting ratio esti- 204  
mated does not meet the screening criteria for signal detection [36]. 205

In a subsequent paper, Souayah et al. [37] estimated on the VAERS 206  
database that the weekly reporting rate of post quadrivalent vaccination 207  
within the first 6 weeks was 6.6 per 10,000,000. Such rate was higher 208  
than the one observed in general population [37], although this matter 209  
is still being discussed [38]. 210

## 2.5. Systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE)

211

The incidence of HPV infection, as well as the risk of developing squa- 212  
mous intraepithelial lesions of the cervix, is higher in patients with SLE 213  
than in unaffected women [39]. Such increased risk may be related to 214  
the treatment for SLE or to other specific host-factors. The immunisation 215  
with the HPV vaccine has therefore a great importance in the prevention 216  
of cancer in these patients, as suggest by current guidelines [39]. 217

Gatto et al. recently reported on six patients, aged between 13 and 32 years, that developed SLE or a SLE-like disease after the first or the second dose of vaccine [40]. A second case series reported three similar situations following the vaccination against HPV [41]. Moreover, in a prospective open-label study with 26 SLE patients enrolled, 33% experienced a disease exacerbation after the vaccination [42]. By contrast, a case-control study failed to confirm these data as it did not show any significant difference in the number of exacerbations between vaccinated and non-vaccinated SLE patients [43]. The power of the study, however, was low and this may have prevented the detection of a small group of patients at higher risk [44].

In an analysis dating to the pre-HPV vaccine era, Siegrist et al. described the background incidence and the expected incidence of hospital admissions for several autoimmune conditions in the vaccine exposed groups [15]. In this work, the authors predicted a hospitalisation rate of two cases per 100,000 vaccine-exposed patients in a temporal association window of 6 weeks after immunisation [15]. These data suggest that a hospital admission for SLE may occur closely to the HPV vaccine shot without any causal relationship. We also recently reported about the absence of a significant increase in the number of hospital discharges for SLE in patients largely exposed to the vaccine [44]. All together, these reports indicate the lack of a significant correlation between HPV vaccination and SLE exacerbation.

## 2.6. Rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and juvenile idiopathic arthritis (JIA)

Rheumatoid arthritis is a chronic inflammatory polyarthritis of unknown aetiology [45]. Unlike SLE, there is not a significant consensus on the increased risk for these patients to develop cervix lesion due to HPV infection. A recent study, however, showed the high prevalence of cervical HPV infection in Mexican women with RA [45]. Indeed the use of HPV vaccination in RA is widespread and at present information about the safety of HPV vaccine in patients with RA is scant, in particular on the possibility that the vaccine exacerbates the disease. Previous reports on other vaccines did not provide a significant relationship: few case series described the occurrence of transient rise of rheumatoid factor or some form of arthritis or RA [17,46,47]. These observations were, however, not confirmed by subsequent analyses showing the absence of increase of RA incidence in vaccinated subjects [17].

Interestingly we have more information on the safety of HPV vaccination and other forms of rheumatic disease. A recent cohort study reported by Heijstek et al. described the efficacy of the HPV vaccine in patients with Juvenile Idiopathic Arthritis (JIA) [48], the most common chronic rheumatic disease in childhood associated with increased susceptibility to infections due both treatments and disease effects [49]. In their prospective controlled observational study, Heijstek et al. included 68 JIA patients and 55 healthy girls aged 12–18 [48]. This study highlighted the safety and immunogenicity of the HPV vaccine and the absence of effect on JIA disease activity also in patients with high baseline disease activity or those using methotrexate [48].

## 2.7. Inflammatory bowel disease (IBD)

Patients with IBD represent a subgroup of subjects exposed to a high risk of cervical dysplasia due to HPV infection [50]. In a recent analysis, Badr Al-Baward et al. observed that the absence of a specific guideline for IBD patients represents a significant concern, mainly for women that were no longer receiving care from their paediatricians when the HPV vaccination became available [51].

The immunogenicity and the safety of HPV vaccine in patients with IBD have been assessed recently by Jacobson et al. in a small study with 37 IBD patients in treatment with immunosuppressive therapy [52]. The results of this analysis indicate that geometric mean titres for HPV-6, HPV-11, HPV-16 and HPV-18 did not qualitatively differ from healthy females and there were no clinically significant vaccine-associated adverse events [52].

## 2.8. Primary ovarian failure (POF)

A possible relationship between POF and HPV vaccine has been proposed in view of the temporal association of the occurrence of this condition and the vaccination [53,54]. Primary ovarian failure is a clinical condition with complex aetiology and 20–30% of the cases are characterised by an autoimmune mechanism [53]. The possible role of HPV vaccine as a trigger factor for an autoimmune insult against the ovary was hypothesised by Colafrancesco et al.; they described three young patients developing POF after HPV vaccination [53]. These cases, along with another previously described may raise concerns on the safety in specific patient at high risk due to unknown factors [53,54]. However, it is also possible that these cases were associated with a genetic risk factor as two of the three patients of Colafrancesco et al. were blood relative [53]. Analyses on a larger number of cases are required to determine conclusively on the association between POF and HPV vaccination.

## 2.9. Other autoimmune diseases

Several case reports and case series demonstrated the possible relationship between HPV vaccination and the occurrence or exacerbation of other, more rare autoimmune diseases [55–62]. In a recent paper, Cerami et al. reported on a case of acquired neuromyotonia following HPV vaccination [55]. It is unclear whatever the vaccination was responsible to trigger an immune-mediated disorder or only played a role in the acceleration of the onset of symptoms [55].

Another interesting report of an autoimmune disease following the inoculation of the HPV vaccine was reported by Della Corte et al., describing a case of type 2 autoimmune hepatitis that occurred to an 11 year old patient [57]. The patient had no previous history for liver, autoimmune diseases and did not report any recent medication other than the HPV vaccine [57]. As stated by the authors, the finding of autoimmune hepatitis in this patient may be coincidental and not related to the vaccine inoculation [57], although a report indicated the relationship between vaccination and the onset of autoimmune hepatitis in the case of the vaccine against hepatitis A [63].

Other cases of diseases described to occur closely in time to the HPV vaccine shot include linear IgA bullous dermatitis [56], Henoch-Schonlein purpura [58], cutaneous vasculitis [58], Kikuchi-Fujimoto disease [59], erythema multiforme [61], acute cerebellar ataxia [60] and immune thrombocytopenic purpura [62]. Reports on these autoimmune diseases are however rare and it is difficult to draw any significant conclusion about their causal association with the HPV vaccination.

## 3. Discussion

Vaccine administration is usually safe and serious adverse events rare. Concerns about the safety of a newly introduced vaccine are commonly observed and are more likely to concern categories of patients that are rarely exposed to vaccines, as were adolescents before the introduction of the HPV vaccine [15].

One such case was the hypothesis of correlation between the Hepatitis B vaccine and MS in adolescents [64]. This hypothesis was supported by reports of temporal association between vaccine shot and MS onset [65,66] and were sufficient to fuel major vaccine-safety controversies. Despite two decades of studies did not find significant evidence of a correlation between this vaccine and MS onset, the confidence in the safety of the Hepatitis B vaccine was lost. Particularly as a result of this controversy, the hepatitis B immunisation programme in France largely failed and vaccine coverage remains below 25% [66].

These lessons about the effect of misinterpretation of the relationship between autoimmune disease and a vaccine should thus be considered when we discuss on the safety of a newly introduced vaccine.

The risk of misinterpretation of causal links is particularly high when we consider the association of autoimmune disease and the HPV

vaccination, because the immunisation is recommended for groups of patients (young female) in which the incidence of autoimmune disease is high [15]. A confounding factor that adds to the problem is the lack of information on the established incidence of several diseases in some regions of the world; this aspect makes it difficult to assess the baseline incidence of a disease and its change after the introduction of a new vaccine.

Along with the risk of misinterpretation of a causal links, we should consider also the risk of ignoring and downplaying the relationship between a vaccine and an adverse event, especially in view of the presence of a well proven screening alternative [1,2,9]. In this view, women need to be informed on the relevance of Pap testing and that vaccines offer HPV infection prevention for a limited period and at some level of risk that is not fully determinable with the information available to date.

As the level of risk is not determinable fully at this time, the role of pharmacovigilance surveillance remains of paramount importance allowing the scientific community to detect unknown or rare events possibly related to the vaccine. The importance of such task increases considering possible adverse event that was not recognised during clinical studies, which are likely to be disregarded as vaccine-related by physician and parents.

An important aspect that may explain why in some but not all cases a causal relationship has been suggested is the possibility of a genetic predisposition to vaccine-induced autoimmune disease. This has been highlighted in a recent report of two blood relative patients [53]. No other studies have proposed a role of genetic factors in vaccine-induced autoimmune disease; however, genetic predisposition may justify why only a small number of subject who receive vaccination will subsequently develop them. The presence of genetic bases of adverse reactions has been described for several drugs and in some cases has reached the clinical practice. One of the most important examples is represented by the HLA-B\*57:01 test for the Abacavir [67]. The introduction of this test resulted in a dramatic reduction of the cases of Abacavir hypersensitivity [67] and made the use of this drug significantly safer. Likewise, testing for HLA-B\*1502 for carbamazepine in the Han Chinese population or HLA-A\*3101 in subjects of Northern European ancestry [68] has been reported to be useful in reducing the risk of carbamazepine-induced Stevens–Johnson syndrome and toxic epidermal necrolysis. More recently HLA-B\*13:01 has been associated with the development of the Dapsone hypersensitivity syndrome amongst patients with leprosy [69]. The identification of genetic bases for adverse events following vaccination should be actively investigated as it would provide a useful tool to prevent rare and serious diseases without impacting negatively on public confidence in immunisation programmes.

#### Q5 Abbreviations

|     |       |                                      |
|-----|-------|--------------------------------------|
| 387 | ADEM  | acute disseminated encephalomyelitis |
| 388 | NMO   | neuromyelitis optica                 |
| 389 | Q6 MS | multiple sclerosis                   |
| 390 | SLE   | systemic lupus erythematosus         |
| 391 | POF   | primary ovarian failure              |
| 392 | JIA   | Juvenile Idiopathic Arthritis        |

393

#### Take-home messages

394

395

396

397

398

399

400

401

402

403

404

- The human papilloma virus (HPV) vaccines are effective in women through 45 years of age for quadrivalent HPV vaccine and 55 years of age for bivalent HPV vaccine. Public health reimbursement covers the cost of vaccines for children up to 15 in most European countries and up to 26 in other Western countries.
- After the implementation of the HPV immunisation programme, several cases of autoimmune disease were reported to literature and safety surveillance programmes generating concerns about the safety of the vaccine.

- As autoimmune diseases occurs frequently in female adolescent, it is difficult to assess the role of HPV vaccine in the pathogenesis of these cases and no conclusive evidence has been reported thus far.
- Public confidence in the safety of a vaccine is of paramount importance and concerns in the absence of solid scientific evidence have already led to the failure of large immunisation programmes.
- Our study identifies the conditions in which HPV immunisation is most likely linked to the development of autoimmune diseases.
- The decision to vaccinate with HPV vaccine is a personal decision, not one that must be made for public health. HPV is not a lethal disease in 95% of the infections; and the other 5% are detectable and treatable in the precancerous stage.

#### Acknowledgements

The financial support by the Italian Medicines Agency, AIFA, and the Centre of Pharmacovigilance of Regione Lombardia (Monitoraggio degli Eventi Avversi in popolazioni fragili project, to EC) and the Italian Ministry of Health (RC 2013 to EC) is gratefully acknowledged.

#### References

- [1] Harper DM, Vierthaler SL, Santee JA. Review of Gardasil. *J Vaccines Vaccin* Nov 23 2010;1(107).
- [2] Harper DM, Williams KB. Prophylactic HPV vaccines: current knowledge of impact on gynecologic premalignancies. *Discov Med* Jul 2010;10(50):7–17.
- [3] Harper DM, Vierthaler SL. Next generation cancer protection: the bivalent HPV vaccine for females. *ISRN Obstet Gynecol* 2011;2011:457204.
- [4] Harper DM. HPV vaccine against HPV infection and disease in males. *N Engl J Med* Jun 2 2011;364(22):2164.
- [5] Harper DM, Vierthaler SL. Who should be targeted for vaccination against anal cancer? *Lancet Oncol* Sep 2011;12(9):828–9.
- [6] Sarojini NB, Srinivasan S, Madhavi Y, et al. The HPV vaccine: science, ethics and regulation. *Econ Polit Weekly* 2010;45(48):27–34.
- [7] Verdenius I, Groner JA, Harper DM. Cross protection against HPV might prevent type replacement. *Lancet Infect Dis* Mar 2013;13(3):195.
- [8] Harper DM, Nieminen P, Paavonen J, Lehtinen M. Cervical cancer incidence can increase despite HPV vaccination. *Lancet Infect Dis* Sep 2010;10(9):594–5 [author reply 5].
- [9] Harper DM. Currently approved prophylactic HPV vaccines. *Expert Rev Vaccines* Dec 2009;8(12):1663–79.
- [10] Harper DM. Current prophylactic HPV vaccines and gynecologic premalignancies. *Curr Opin Obstet Gynecol* Dec 2009;21(6):457–64.
- [11] Harper DM. Prevention of human papillomavirus infections and associated diseases by vaccination: a new hope for global public health. *Public Health Genomics* 2009;12(5–6):319–30.
- [12] Tomljenovic L, Spinosa JP, Shaw CA. Human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccines as an option for preventing cervical malignancies: (how) effective and safe? *Curr Pharm Des* 2013;19(8):1466–87.
- [13] Gerhardus A, Razum O. A long story made too short: surrogate variables and the communication of HPV vaccine trial results. *J Epidemiol Community Health* 2010;64(5):377–8.
- [14] Macartney KK, Chiu C, Georgousakis M, Brotherton JM. Safety of human papillomavirus vaccines: a review. *Drug Saf* 2013;36:393–412.
- [15] Siegrist CA, Lewis EM, Eskola J, Evans SJ, Black SB. Human papilloma virus immunization in adolescent and young adults: a cohort study to illustrate what events might be mistaken for adverse reactions. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 2007;26:979–84.
- [16] Slade BA, Leidel L, Vellozzi C, Woo EJ, Hua W, Sutherland A, et al. Postlicensure safety surveillance for quadrivalent human papillomavirus recombinant vaccine. *JAMA* 2009;19:750–7.
- [17] Shoenfeld Y, Aron-Maor A. Vaccination and autoimmunity–'vaccinosis': a dangerous liaison. *J Autoimmun* 2000;14:1–10.
- [18] Salemi S, D'Amelio R. Could autoimmunity be induced by vaccination? *Int Rev Immunol* 2010;29:247–69.
- [19] Orbach H, Agmon-Levin N, Zandman-Goddard G. Vaccines and autoimmune diseases of the adult. *Discov Med* 2010;9:90–7.
- [20] Schäffer V, Wimmer S, Rotaru I, et al. HPV vaccine: a cornerstone of female health a possible cause of ADEM? *J Neurol* 2008;255:1818–20.
- [21] Wildemann B, Jarius S, Hartmann M, et al. Acute disseminated encephalomyelitis following vaccination against human papilloma virus. *Neurology* 2009;72:2132–3.
- [22] Mendoza Plasencia Z, González López M, Fernández Sanfiel ML. Muñoz Montes Acute disseminated encephalomyelitis with tumefactive lesions after vaccination against human papillomavirus. *Neurologia* 2010;25:58–9.
- [23] Pellegrino P, Carnovale C, Perrone V, Antoniazzi S, Pozzi M, Clementi E, et al. Can HPV immunisation cause ADEM? Two case reports and literature review. *Mult Scler* Aug 22 2013 [Epub ahead of print].

- 483 [24] DiMario Jr FJ, Hajjar M, Ciesielski T. A 16-year-old girl with bilateral visual  
484 loss and left hemiparesis following an immunization against human papillo-  
485 ma virus. *J Child Neurol* 2010;25:321–7.
- 486 [25] Pellegrino P, Carnovale C, Perrone V, Pozzi M, Antoniazzi S, Clementi E, et al. Acute dis-  
487 seminated encephalomyelitis onset: evaluation based on vaccine adverse  
488 events reporting systems. *PLoS One* 2013;8:e77766. [http://dx.doi.org/](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0077766)  
489 [10.1371/journal.pone.0077766](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0077766).
- 490 [26] Menge T, Cree B, Saleh A, Waterboer T, Berthele A, Kalluri SR, et al. Neuro-  
491 myelitis optica following human papillomavirus vaccination. *Neurology*  
492 2012;79:285–7.
- 493 [27] Wingerchuk DM, Lennon VA, Lucchinetti CF, Pittock SJ, Weinshenker BG. The spec-  
494 trum of neuromyelitis optica. *Lancet Neurol* 2007;6:805–15.
- 495 [28] Farrell RA. Comment: human papillomavirus vaccination, induced autoimmunity,  
496 and neuromyelitis optica. *Neurology* 2012;79:287.
- 497 [29] Herroelen L, de Keyser J, Ebinger G. Central-nervous-system demyelination after  
498 immunisation with recombinant hepatitis B vaccine. *Lancet* 1991;338:1174–5.
- 499 [30] DeStefano F, Verstraeten T, Chen RT. Hepatitis B vaccine and risk of multiple sclero-  
500 sis. *Expert Rev Vaccines* 2002;4:461–6.
- 501 [31] Sutton I, Lahoria R, Tan I, Clouston P, Barnett M. CNS demyelination and  
502 quadrivalent HPV vaccination. *Mult Scler* 2009;15:116–9.
- 503 [32] Chang J, Campagnolo D, Vollmer TL, Bomprezzi R. Demyelinating disease and poly-  
504 valent human papilloma virus vaccination. *J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry*  
505 2011;82:1296–8.
- 506 [33] Pellegrino P, Carnovale C, Perrone V, Antoniazzi S, Pozzi M, Clementi E, et al. No evi-  
507 dence of a link between multiple sclerosis and the vaccine against the human papil-  
508 lomavirus. *Eur J Epidemiol* 2013;28:705–7.
- 509 [34] Kwong JC, Vasa PP, Campitelli MA, Hawken S, Wilson K, Rosella LC, et al. Risk of  
510 Guillain-Barré syndrome after seasonal influenza vaccination and influenza  
511 health-care encounters: a self-controlled study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2013;13:769–76.
- 512 **Q8** [35] Ojha RP, Jackson BE, Tota JE, Offutt-Powell TN, Singh KP, Bae S, Guillain-Barré syn-  
513 drome following quadrivalent human papillomavirus vaccination among vaccine-  
514 eligible individuals in the United States. *Hum Vaccin Immunother* 2013;10:1.
- 515 [36] Slade BA, Leidel L, Vellozzi C, Woo EJ, Hua W, Sutherland A, et al. Postlicensure safety  
516 surveillance for quadrivalent human papillomavirus recombinant vaccine. *JAMA*  
517 2009;302:750–7.
- 518 [37] Souayah N, Michas-Martin PA, Nasar A, et al. Guillain-Barré syndrome after Gardasil  
519 vaccination: data from Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting System 2006–2009. *Vac-*  
520 *cine* 2011;29(5):886–9.
- 521 [38] Slade BA, Gee J, Broder KR, Vellozzi C. Comment on the contribution by Souayah  
522 et al., “Guillain-Barré syndrome after Gardasil vaccination: data from Vaccine Ad-  
523 verse Event Reporting System 2006–2009”. *Vaccine* Jan 29 2011;29(5):865–6.
- 524 [39] Heijstek MW, de Bruin LM Ott, Bijl M, et al. EULAR recommendations for vaccination  
525 in paediatric patients with rheumatic diseases. *Ann Rheum Dis* 2011;70:1704–12.
- 526 [40] Gatto M, Agmon-Levin N, Soriano A, Manna R, Maoz-Segal R, Kivity S, et al. Human  
527 papillomavirus vaccine and systemic lupus erythematosus. *Clin Rheumatol*  
528 2013;32:1301–7.
- 529 [41] Soldevilla HF, Briones SF, Navarra SV. Systemic lupus erythematosus following HPV  
530 immunization or infection? *Lupus* 2012;21:158–61.
- 531 [42] Soybilgic A, Onel KB, Utset T, Alexander K, Wagner-Weiner L safety and immunoge-  
532 nicity of the quadrivalent HPV vaccine in female systemic lupus erythematosus pa-  
533 tients aged 12 to 26 years. *Pediatr Rheumatol Online J* 2013;11:29.
- 534 [43] Mok CC, Ho LY, Fong LS, To CH. Immunogenicity and safety of a quadrivalent human  
535 papillomavirus vaccine in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus: a case-con-  
536 trol study. *Ann Rheum Dis* 2013;72:659–64.
- 537 [44] Pellegrino P, Carnovale C, Perrone V, Salvati D, Gentili M, Antoniazzi S, et al. Human  
538 papillomavirus vaccine in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus. *Epidemiology*  
539 2014(1):155–6. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/EDE.0000000000000033>.
- 540 [45] Rojo-Contreras W, Olivas-Flores EM, Gamez-Nava JI, Montoya-Fuentes H,  
541 Trujillo-Hernandez B, Trujillo X, et al. Cervical human papillomavirus infection in  
542 Mexican women with systemic lupus erythematosus or rheumatoid arthritis.  
543 *Lupus* 2012;21:365–72.
- 544 [46] Gross K, Combe C, Krüger K, Schattenkirchner M. Arthritis after hepatitis B vaccina-  
545 tion. Report of three cases. *Scand J Rheumatol* 1995;24:50–2.
- 546 [47] Pope JE, Stevens A, Howson W, Bell DA. The development of rheumatoid arthritis  
547 after recombinant hepatitis B vaccination. *J Rheumatol* 1998;25:1687–93.
- 548 [48] Heijstek MW, Scherpenisse M, Groot N, Tacke C, Schepp RM, Buisman AM,  
549 et al. Immunogenicity and safety of the bivalent HPV vaccine in female pa-  
550 tients with juvenile idiopathic arthritis: a prospective controlled observa-  
551 tional cohort study. *Ann Rheum Dis* 2013;30.
- 552 [49] Beena JP. Juvenile idiopathic arthritis: review of the literature and case report. *J Dent*  
553 *Child (Chic)* 2013;80:25–30.
- 554 [50] Kane S, Khatibi B, Reddy D. Higher incidence of abnormal Pap smears in women with  
555 inflammatory bowel disease. *Am J Gastroenterol* 2008;103:631–6.
- 556 [51] Al-Bawardy B, Fine S, Lafond J, Doran A, Borum ML. Missing cohort: inflammatory  
557 bowel disease patients at increased risk for cervical dysplasia may be  
558 undervaccinated for HPV. *Inflamm Bowel Dis* 2012;18:797.
- 559 [52] Jacobson DL, Bousvaros A, Ashworth L, Carey R, Shrier LA, Burchett SK, et al.  
560 Immunogenicity and tolerability to human papillomavirus-like particle vac-  
561 cine in girls and young women with inflammatory bowel disease. *Inflamm Bowel*  
562 *Dis* 2013;19:1441–9.
- 563 [53] Colafrancesco S, Perricone C, Tomljenovic L, Shoenfeld Y. Human papilloma  
564 virus vaccine and primary ovarian failure: another facet of the autoim-  
565 mune/inflammatory syndrome induced by adjuvants. *Am J Reprod Immunol*  
566 2013;31.
- 567 [54] Little DT, Ward HR. Premature ovarian failure 3 years after menarche in a 16-  
568 year-old girl following human papillomavirus vaccination. *BMJ Case Rep Sep*  
569 **30** 2012.
- 570 [55] Cerami C, Corbo M, Piccolo G, Iannaccone S. Autoimmune neuromyotonia following  
571 human papilloma virus vaccination. *Muscle Nerve* Mar 2013;47(3):466–7.
- 572 [56] Ikeya S, Urano S, Tokura Y. Linear IgA bullous dermatosis following human papillo-  
573 mavirus vaccination. *Eur J Dermatol* 2012;22:787–8.
- 574 [57] Della Corte C, Carlucci A, Francalanci P, Alisi A, Nobili V. Autoimmune hepatitis type  
575 2 following anti-papillomavirus vaccination in a 11-year-old girl. *Vaccine*  
576 2011;29:4654–6.
- 577 [58] Melo Gomes S, Glover M, Malone M, Brogan P. Vasculitis following HPV immuniza-  
578 tion. *Rheumatology (Oxford)* 2013;52:581–2.
- 579 [59] Watanabe T, Hashidate H, Hirayama Y, Iinuma Y. Kikuchi-Fujimoto disease follow-  
580 ing vaccination against human papilloma virus infection and Japanese encephalitis.  
581 *Eur J Pediatr* 2012;171:1409–11.
- 582 [60] Yonee C, et al. Association of acute cerebellar ataxia and human papilloma virus vac-  
583 cination: a case report. *Neuropediatrics* 2013;44:265–7.
- 584 [61] Katoulis AC, Liakou A, Bozi E, Theodorakis M, Alevizou A, Zafeiraki A, et al. Erythema  
585 multiforme following vaccination for human papillomavirus. *Dermatology*  
586 2010;220:60–2.
- 587 [62] Pugno G, Ysebaert L, Bagheri H, Montastruc JL, Laurent G. Immune thrombo-  
588 cytopenic purpura following human papillomavirus vaccination. *Vaccine Jun*  
589 **8** 2009;27(28):3690.
- 590 [63] Berry PA, Smith-Laing G. Hepatitis A vaccine associated with autoimmune hepatitis.  
591 *World J Gastroenterol* 2007;13:2238–9.
- 592 [64] Herroelen L, de Keyser J, Ebinger G. Central-nervous-system demyelination after  
593 immunisation with recombinant hepatitis B vaccine. *Lancet* 1991;1174–5.
- 594 [65] Marshall E. A shadow falls on hepatitis B vaccination effort. *Science* 1998;31:630–1.
- 595 [66] DeStefano F, Weintraub ES, Chen RT. Recombinant hepatitis B vaccine and the risk of  
596 multiple sclerosis: a prospective study. *Neurology* 2005;64:1317–8.
- 597 [67] Guo Y, Shi L, Hong H, Su Z, Fuscoe J, Ning B. Studies on abacavir-induced hypersen-  
598 sivity reaction: a successful example of translation of pharmacogenetics to person-  
599 alized medicine. *Sci China Life Sci* 2013;56:119–24.
- 600 [68] McCormack M, Alfirevic A, Bourgeois S, Farrell JJ, Kasperavičiūtė D, et al. HLA-A\*3101  
601 and carbamazepine-induced hypersensitivity reactions in Europeans. *N Engl J Med*  
602 2011;364:1134–43.
- 603 [69] Zhang FR, Liu H, Irwanto A, Fu XA, Li Y, Yu GQ, et al. HLA-B\*13:01 and the dapsone  
604 hypersensitivity syndrome. *N Engl J Med* 2013;369:1620–8.